

Higher Education Relevance and Quality Agency



**Ethiopian Civil Service University
Institutional Quality Audit Report**

***HERQA Publication Series -054
May 2013***

**This document reports on a HERQA Institutional Quality Audit carried
out between 27- 30, December 2011**

at

**Ethiopian Civil Service University PO Box 5648 Addis Ababa Phone:
011-646-2344 Fax: +251-116-46-30-16 Email: ecsscpro@ecsc.edu.et**

Higher Education Relevance and Quality Agency

Ethiopian Civil Service University

Institutional Quality Audit Report

Contents

	Page
Foreword	iii
Introduction	1
HERQA's Approach to Institutional Quality Auditing	1
Executive Summary	3
The Institution	10
The Institutional Self Evaluation	13
The Institutional Quality Audit Process.....	14
The Institutional Quality Audit.....	15
<i>1: Vision, Mission and Educational Goals.....</i>	<i>15</i>
<i>2: Governance and Management System</i>	<i>19</i>
<i>3: Infrastructure and Learning Resources.....</i>	<i>23</i>
<i>4: Academic and Support Staff</i>	<i>28</i>
<i>5: Student Admission and Support Services.....</i>	<i>37</i>
<i>6: Program Relevance and Curriculum.....</i>	<i>45</i>
<i>7: Teaching, Learning and Assessment</i>	<i>48</i>
<i>8: Student Progression and Graduate Outcomes.....</i>	<i>54</i>
<i>9: Research and Outreach Activities.....</i>	<i>57</i>
<i>10: Internal Quality Assurance.....</i>	<i>61</i>
Thematic Enquiries and Audit Trails.....	63
Good Practices	63

Plans for enhancement of processes and practices.....	65
Conclusion	65
<i>Appendix 1: Acronyms</i>	66
<i>Appendix 2: The Institutional Quality Audit Team</i>	67
<i>Appendix 3: Timetable of the Institutional Quality Audit Visit</i>	68
<i>Appendix 4: Participants in meetings held during the Institutional Quality Audit</i>	69
<i>Appendix 5: Documents requested from the University</i>	72
<i>Appendix 6: Documents consulted for the Institutional Quality Audit</i>	77

Foreword

The Ethiopian government established the Higher Education Relevance and Quality Agency (HERQA) through Higher Education Proclamation 351 in 2003 with the aim of monitoring and supporting higher education institutions in order to provide quality and relevant higher education. In 2009, HERQA's mandates and responsibilities have been amended through Higher Education Proclamation 650 to ensure that Higher Education Institutions (HEIs) provide high quality and relevant higher education.

Currently, HERQA auditors use ten focus areas to assess and evaluate the quality of higher education within both government and private higher education institutions. Identified areas of strengths are commended and shortcomings are observed, recommendations for improvement are made. As the Agency evolves, it continues to evaluate and refine its process of assessment and monitoring of higher education institutions to provide quality education and maintain high standards within all institutions of higher learning in Ethiopia.

So far, 40 higher education institutions have been audited and 25 reports have been published and disseminated to stakeholders. I believe the HEIs that have participated in the auditing process have been able to receive affirmation of their strengths in addition to guidance on how they can improve in order to provide high quality service to their stakeholders. These are commendable achievements for HERQA and the country in a relatively short time; and the achievements could not have been made without the support and contributions from the Minister of Education, the HERQA Board, Suzan Hale from IFESH and, above all, the dedicated staff and support from external auditors.

In the spirit of collaboration in developing quality higher education system, I hope you have found the audit process rewarding, even if challenging, and the report a valuable tool for continuous improvement and enhancement of quality assurance.

Tesfaye Teshome (PhD and Associate Professor)

Director General of Higher Education Relevance and Quality Agency (HERQA)

Higher Education Relevance and Quality Agency

Ethiopian Civil Service University

Institutional Quality Audit Report

Introduction

HERQA is an autonomous Agency established through the Higher Education Proclamation 351 in 2003 as the key agency responsible for guiding and regulating the higher education sector in Ethiopia. In 2009, its mandates and responsibilities have been amended through another proclamation (No. 650/2009). HERQA has been established because of the need for Ethiopia to have a high quality assurance agency capable of monitoring HEIs to ensure they provide a high quality and relevant higher education provision in the country. One of the central roles of HERQA is to encourage and assist the growth of an institutional culture in Ethiopian higher education that values quality and is committed to continuous improvement.

One of HERQA's key activities is to conduct Institutional Quality Audits of HEIs. An Institutional Quality Audit is an in-depth analysis and assessment of the quality of the teaching and learning environment, the relevance of programs delivered by HEIs, the effectiveness of a HEI's approach to quality assurance, its systems of accountability and its internal review mechanisms. The product of an Institutional Quality Audit is an Institutional Quality Audit Report.

HERQA intends that through its Institutional Quality Audit Reports and the dissemination of good practice that it will help to enhance the provision of higher education in Ethiopia and the confidence of all stakeholders in the quality and relevance of that provision.

HERQA's Approach to Institutional Quality Auditing

A HERQA institutional quality audit proceeds through a number of stages. The initial action is a self-evaluation carried out by the HEI to be audited. HERQA asks that this should deal with ten focus areas. These are as follows:

- 1: Vision, Mission and Educational Goals
- 2: Governance and Management System
- 3: Infrastructure and Learning Resources
- 4: Academic and Support Staff
- 5: Student Admission and Support Services
- 6: Program Relevance and Curriculum
- 7: Teaching, Learning and Assessment
- 8: Student Progression and Graduate Outcomes
- 9: Research and Outreach Activities
- 10: Internal Quality Assurance

HERQA has issued documentation to illuminate each of the above areas providing reference points and indicating possible sources of evidence.

HERQA has issued documentation to illustrate each of the above areas and provide reference points and sources of evidence.

Following the institutional self-evaluation, the HEI prepares a Self Evaluation Document (SED) organized in accord with guidelines issued by HERQA. This helps to ensure that all SEDs deal with the same aspects of the work of higher education institutions and are of similar structure and length. Completed SEDs are sent to HERQA.

Following the receipt of the SED, HERQA initiates a dialogue with the HEI to establish a timeline for the institutional quality audit. HERQA also selects a team of trained institutional quality auditors (normally five people), sends the names of the proposed team to the HEI and asks the HEI to consider if any member may be unsuitable. Where justifiable reasons for unsuitability are identified by HERQA (e.g. possible conflict of interest) then the auditor will be replaced with one acceptable to the institution.

Following analysis of the SED by the auditors, two members of the audit team make a one-day briefing visit of the HEI. The purpose of the visit is to help ensure a common understanding of the audit procedure in the HEI; help the HEI make the necessary preparations and arrangements for the audit and to indicate further information that, the HEI should try to make available to the audit team. During this visit, the timetable for the institutional quality audit visit is discussed and where possible, the date for the visit is confirmed.

The institutional quality audit is conducted during a four-day visit to the HEI by the team of auditors. The key purpose of the audit visit is to validate the SED submitted by the HEI.

During the visit, the team studies documentation, visits facilities, meets with staff and students and observes teaching. At the end of the visit, the team makes a brief oral report to the President of the HEI.

Following the institutional quality audit visit the audit team drafts an audit report. The audit report is sent to the HEI to check for factual accuracy. HERQA then publishes a final Institutional Quality Audit Report. An Institutional Quality Audit Report seeks to make clear HERQA's confidence in the ability of the HEI to provide appropriate degree level education. Importantly, a report also aims to support a HEI by recognizing its good practices and by indicating areas where changes in provision and practice can improve the quality and/or relevance of its activities.

Further to the institutional quality audit report, the HEI is required to prepare an action plan that states how it intends to enhance the quality and relevance of its provision based on the recommendations forwarded. HERQA requests a copy of this plan and monitors its implementation. Subsequent institutional quality audits consider the extent to which the HEI has been able to use its action plan to enhance quality and relevance.

Higher Education Relevance and Quality Agency

Ethiopian Civil Service University Institutional

Quality Audit Report

Executive Summary

This document reports on the external Institutional Quality Audit of Ethiopian Civil Service University (ECSU) carried out by a team of five external auditors in December 2011. The starting point for the Audit was a Self Evaluation Document (SED) prepared by the University. The quality audit centered on ten focus areas identified by HERQA with a view to validating the SED, judging the extent to which the University is fit for its declared purpose and determining the level of confidence in the University's ability to provide relevant and appropriate higher education and safeguard the standards of its degrees. The External Quality Audit (EQA) team spent four days at the University. During their visit, the team had seventeen formal meetings with members of the academic staff, one meeting with students, and one meeting with management and senior staff. In addition, they observed teaching in five classes, visited a range of facilities, and met with individual academic staff, support staff and managers (administrators).

Ethiopian Civil Service University was first established by the Councils of Ministers regulation No. 3/1996. Later on, it was reestablished following the Councils of Ministers regulation No. 12/2006, which repealed the previous regulation. It was founded as an Institute of Higher Education to contribute its share in the producing and developing of skilled civil servants for the country's public service institutions.

Initially, it started its operation as a College in 1987 EC with only two Departments with degree-level programs namely, Economics and Law with about 400 students. After having made a huge attempt to expand its services both in diversity and accessibility, at this moment, ECSU has nine Institutes which provide undergraduate and graduate (postgraduate) education programs, short-term trainings, and conduct research and consultancy services in various modalities including regular, continuing and distance learning. Currently, the number of students enrolled at ECSU is 3778 in the regular program; 731 in continuing education and 2990 in distance education. Overall, the total number of students is 7499. Out of these, nearly one third is Masters Degree students in the nine different fields of studies.

The University, in addition to its educational programs and research undertakings, provides short term trainings and consultancy services to civil service organizations in a broad spectrum of areas; mainly related to the civil service reform programs and to key government development areas. Other than in-house services, the University also provides trainings through Video conferencing and e-learning using its well equipped Development Learning Center (DLC). The University has a Research, Publication Coordination Office (RPCO), which is accountable to the Vice President for Academic Development (VPAD) and coordinates and facilitates the research and publications work of the University. The University has established a Center for Academic and Professional Development (CAPD) to build the human capital of the University.

The University has grown from 400 students at its establishment to already 7499 students. To discharge all the duties and responsibilities, ECSU has 254 full time instructors (218 local academic, 36 expatriate academic) including 36 female members of academic staff. It has also 696 administration support staff which gives a total number of 950 employees.

The University has grown successfully from its parent institution and has expanded its services. The vision statement of the University in the SED is to *be Excellence in public sector capacity building*.

The EQA team established the following findings from its audit visit.

1. Ethiopian Civil Service University is a government higher education institution focusing on specialized programs that are not offered in other higher education institutions, but are essential to fill the gaps in the civil service of the nation.
2. The University was very well prepared for the visit of the audit team. The required documents and additional documents made in place for the EQA team were well documented, systematic, and easily accessible to the team; visits and further information were readily agreed and acted on.
3. The University has grown from an initial student number of around 400 at its establishment to more than 7000.
4. The vision of the University is "Excellence in public sector capacity building" is not time or geographically bound.
5. The mission statement of the University embraces its commitment to building capacities in the public sector through specialized education, training, research, consultancy and professional certification services.
6. A comprehensive set of core values like stakeholder focus, continuous learning, welcoming diversity, attention to the disadvantaged and commitment underpin the work of the University.
7. In the process of formulating the Balanced Scorecard (BSC) three strategic themes are identified at corporate level; excellence in academic and professional service for the public sector; organizational capacity building and strategic networking and partnership.
8. The ECSU was established with the objective of building the capacities of the country's civil service by designing and offering specialized education, short-term training, research and consultancy services.
9. The EQA team concludes that the University has clearly stated the mission and values which provide a concrete base for its existence. However, more is needed to ensure that the vision and mission are inculcated in the minds and hearts of the University community at large. The team was of the opinion that the University needs to revisit its vision in line with its core strategic theme identified in the BSC document.
10. The University has a comprehensive, Five Year Strategic Plan (2003-2007 EC) in BSC format that shows its long term strategic themes/issues or priorities to guide its continued development in order to achieve efficiency and effectiveness in all its services within the context of a modern capacity building higher education institution focusing on public service.
11. The leadership of the University is few in number but very committed. There are swift and efficient management setups in comparison with similar government HEIs; well-organized follow up of the University properties and premises; efficient utilization of the budget; adequate supportive staff and a conducive working environment. However, the absence of student representation on the department council could be cited as a negative drawback in the implementation of good governance in the ECSU.
12. The Academic Legislation is a key document that establishes the academic rules, regulations and many of the working procedures of the University.
13. The management of the University is transparent and participatory with staff and student representation on different committees.
14. Communication structures in the University are good and functional. It is aided by an open door policy.
15. The University has developed positive staff and student relationships and an environment conducive to academic endeavor.
16. There is a firm foundation established to realize a quality assurance system; the tasks are shared by staff and students of the University community. Moreover, a strong foundation of inputs, process and output helps quality work such as a generous instructor / student ratio; well-committed and motivated staff; well-established libraries; sufficient supply of teaching and other materials; efficient utilization of the budget; existence of an entrance exam and the support of the training through tutorial services and internship.

Higher Education Relevance and Quality Agency

Ethiopian Civil Service University Institutional

Quality Audit Report

17. The University has adequate teaching space and facilities for the current number of regular students. It has witnessed both horizontal and vertical growth and differentiation of programs in attaining its mission to fill the gaps of human capital in the Ethiopian civil service sector.
18. There are sufficient private offices for the academic staff of the University to carry out the necessary preparation and marking or to meet with students in need of academic counseling.
19. The University's ICT and Internet situation are in good condition. Thus, students can get sufficient access to internet.
20. The Library of the University is very well organized and supported with a well developed software system. It has adequate space, sufficient academic journals, and an updated collection of books, reference materials, periodicals, access to e-Books and other internet services. The system enables these resources to be easily accessible to students including physically challenged students.. There is a reading room and an internet section for students with special needs. It has eight computers uploaded with JAW software that enables visually impaired students to browse internet resources.
21. There is a fair and transparent appointment procedure for academic staff in the University.
22. The University has clear and transparent criteria and procedures for promotion of staff but it does not have Ethiopian teaching staff promoted to professorial rank.
23. Some members of staff in all departments have several years of experience and some teachers have a PhD. However, staffing of the University in general falls short of that specified by the Ministry of Education. First-degree holders do the teaching on some programs. Therefore, the University is required to devise a mechanism to improve the qualification of first degree holder staff's profile.
24. The University needs to maintain its commitment to staff development. The existing pedagogical skill trainings, further education and other development schemes for staff should be sustained.
25. From the data provided to the EQA team on student and staff numbers, the average student/staff ratio for regular programs in the University is between 11:1 and 23:1. This is generous and could have a paramount benefit for the teaching/learning process.
26. Class size is usually kept within the range of 35-45 and total enrollments are limited.
27. The classrooms are well ventilated and lighted.
28. Staff appraisal in the University seems effective in identifying staff development needs and rewarding members of staff that perform well. This is being strengthened along with the implementation of the strategic change management tool: BSC.
29. The admission policy of the University for regular and extension students in the undergraduate requires the completion of 12th grade with a minimum GPA of 2.00 in the Ethiopian School Leaving Certificate Examination (ESLCE); alternatively, completion of preparatory school, holding a diploma in relevant field with a minimum CGPA 2.00; or recommendation by the capacity building/Civil Service Bureau of Regional States or concerned federal government offices. All candidates must pass the entrance examination of the University to ascertain the candidate's inclination towards his choice of specialization.
30. The requirement of entrance exams has increased the competitiveness and motivation of the students.
31. The EQA team observed the need for maintenance of doors in some classrooms and the need for improvement of the sanitation of toilets at the Kotebe Campus. Most offices and classroom facilities are not easily accessible for students with disabilities.
32. The University is required to strengthen and support students' use of the web for academic resources.
33. There is a need to produce training manuals for computer laboratories and additional courses.
34. The soil and material laboratory is not fully functional. It can only be used to perform simple material tests due to lack of appropriate equipment and necessary materials.
35. At the time of the audit, the EQA team observed that the bridge between the student dormitory and cafeteria needs maintenance for safe access. The bridge is currently unsafe for passing between the dormitory and cafeteria. The University informed the EQA team that the bid was publicly announced for the construction of the bridge.

36. The lack of outdoor space on campus does not allow the University to offer students athletics program. It was noted that the University has a critical scarcity regarding football, basketball and volleyball fields. It was reported that the absence of the football field prevents students from participating in football and athletics competitions.
37. The absence of food/snacks in the students' lounge creates dissatisfaction among students.
38. New students have a structured induction to the University and receive a comprehensive handbook.
39. The Students Service and Registrar Office of the University work closely with the student community on the provision of a range of services for students.
40. The University has established and organized a Student Council, which is efficient and functional.
41. Recently, the University has established a Guidance and Counseling office. The Coordinator of the office holds a Bachelor degree in psychology and master's degree in measurement and evaluation. He has the potential to strengthen and provide the necessary support. At the time of the audit, a draft document for guidance was being prepared.
42. Academic advice through regular consultation hours seems realistic.
43. Well organized tutorial programs have been arranged to support students as per their request. A special tutorial service is being offered to female students and to students coming from emerging regions.
44. Student discipline cases are subject to disciplinary actions in accordance with Code of Conduct. The responsibility for the implementation of provisions pertaining to the Code of Conduct of students rests with faculties and the office of Director of Students.
45. The Clinic is located in the basement of the male student dormitory. It is clean and staffed with appropriate professionals and equipped with the necessary medical equipment. However, the location is not appropriate to offer health services as voiced by some respondents. During the visit, it was observed that a new building is under construction and it was reported that it will be used primarily for health services.
46. The University has established an independent HIV and AIDS management unit. The services provided are very efficient. The University has an annual plan and a reporting mechanism in place. According to the 2003 EC plan and results of HIV and AIDS mainstreaming activities, most were accomplished beyond the plan.
47. The University has different committees and a well structured set of procedures designed to ensure that curriculum development results in relevant and required programs of appropriate standard but their work is not informed by clear decision-making criteria.
48. In approving new courses and programs in some departments, the University has a system for considering student workload other than in lecture equivalent hours.
49. While the curriculum development is practical, the involvement of external stakeholders in curriculum development should be strengthened.
50. A planned program of regular curriculum reviews is embedded in the practices of the University.
51. The University has course catalogues and many course descriptions which state the expected learning outcomes that should be the basis for student assessment.
52. The University has a written policy on teaching and learning which is found in the Training Policy & Guidelines May 2009.
53. The University promotes a range of approaches to teaching and learning and there is good evidence to support the claim that instructors use a range of methods. There is a well organized and effective internship program in some departments. Students' final projects involve problem solving strategies and critical thinking skills targeted to the local needs of civil service organizations.
54. There is sound evidence that students are assessed based on their achievement of the expected learning outcomes of the courses they have attended.
55. The University has developed a grading system in which a number of departments have been applying the criteria referenced assessment approach that entails the implementation of a fixed grading system.

Higher Education Relevance and Quality Agency

Ethiopian Civil Service University Institutional

Quality Audit Report

56. There is evidence that a transparent appeals system is applied within the University to ensure that students are graded fairly and consistently and are well protected from discrimination and unmerited or inaccurate grades awarded by the staff.
57. The University has various figures for attrition, which indicate that the average may range between 6 and 7%. The University needs to review how data on student attrition should be collected and analyzed so that it reflects the attrition rate for each cohort of students per semester in each department.
58. The University has implemented measures to retain students and limit attrition. These need to be continued.
59. The University has formal contact with its graduates but has no Alumni Association.
60. The EQA team found evidence that the University has a Research and Consultancy Coordination Office (RCCO) which is accountable to the Vice President of Academic Development. The office has set its own Research Policy & Guidelines (May 2009). The staffs of the University are encouraged to utilize a quarter of their time in research because it is one of the core activities of HEIs.
61. The academic staffs of the University are moderately engaged in research while research is part of the culture of the University.
62. The research findings of the academic staff of ECSU and students were disseminated through local and international journals, ECSU's website, conference presentations, an annual symposium and policy briefs. The EQA team had access to two types of Journals published by ECSU and a proceeding in which the outputs of annual research conferences were published. The first journal is Journal of African Development Studies (JADS), an annual journal where the first issue appeared in December 2010. The second journal is Ethiopian Journal of Public Management and Development (EJPMD), an annual journal, the first issue of which appeared in July 2010.
63. The University has ample national and international academic linkages.
64. The University has a Consultancy Policy and Guidelines for effective implementation of the outreach activities or consultancy services stated in the mission statement and objectives and goals of the University. However, there is a need to strengthen the systematic recording of all the outreach activities carried out by the University.
65. The University provides a remarkable service to stakeholders with regard to short term training. It also provides training through Video-conferencing and e-learning through the use of its well equipped DLC.
66. The University has established the foundations for assuring quality activities as evidenced by the establishment of a Quality Assurance Office coordinated by a team leader with two quality assurance experts. It is a well established, fully functional, and integrated quality assurance system.
67. The University has incorporated several points regarding quality assurance in the Education policy guideline.
68. The University has established functional mechanisms for the identification and dissemination of best practices.

The overall conclusion of the EQA team is that the Ethiopian Civil Service University is a modest size government higher education institution. It focuses on specialized programs that are not offered in other higher education institutions, but are essential to fill the gaps in the civil service of the nation and are given utmost priority. Besides having graduated thousands of students from regular degree programs, it has put in place an infrastructure and established practices that could allow for more growth in regular student numbers should the demand arise. The University has found it difficult to recruit adequate number of staff with PhDs and hence, is not meeting Ministry of Education requirements. However, a total of 44 academic staff of ECSU is now attending their PhD study. Thus the EQA team is of the opinion that the University needs to maintain its efforts to support staff development.

The University has made significant efforts to monitor the quality and relevance of the education it is providing. As research and community services are the two major tasks among the core activities, the University has developed a research culture among its staff. Research contributes a viable service to the surrounding community.

The vision statement of the University is "*Excellence in Public Sector Capacity Building*". This statement is not time bound or geographically bound. The University will continue to require effort and considerable resources to further its current position in the realization of its vision, however, the foundation for the necessary development is firm.

The report commends the University on 67 activities. It offers 30 essential recommendations, 25 advisable recommendations and 18 desirable recommendations.

Ethiopian Civil Service University

Institutional Quality Audit Report

The Institution

On the brink, the government established the Ethiopian Civil Service College in 1995 to satisfy the need for trained man power and to build the capacity of the civil service in the country on a continuous basis. The College formally started its operations at the EELPA training site located at Kotebe area. Its initial intake was about 400 students attending Law and Economics degree programs. A year later, the Ethiopian Civil Service College was formally established by the Council of Ministers Regulation No. 3/1996 as an autonomous higher education institution with the objective of building the capacity of the country's civil service by designing and offering specialized education, short term training, and research and consultancy services. Later on, it was reestablished following the Council of Ministers Regulation No.12/2006, which repealed the previous regulation. It was established as an Institute of Higher Education to contribute its share in the production and development of proficient civil servants for the country's public service organizations.

After having made a huge effort to expand its services both in diversity and accessibility, at this moment, ECSU comprises nine institutes that offer undergraduate and postgraduate education programs, short-term trainings, and conduct research and consultancy services. These are being executed with a variety of delivery modalities ranging from regular to evening to distance / virtual (print and technology-assisted) programs. It has recently achieved University status.

ECSU is a boarding institution. Regular students have dormitories; each student contributes about 750 birr per academic year. What students pay is so small that it does not wholly cover the cost.

At present, the ECSU constitutes the following Institutes that offer Bachelor Degree, Masters Degree and PhD programs;

- 1) Institute of Public Management and Development Studies (IPMDS) awards
 - BA Degree in Development Management MA*
 - Degree in Development Economics*
 - MA Degree in Public Management (to be launched in 2011/2012)*
- 2) Institute of Urban Development Studies (IUDS) offers
 - BA Degree in Urban Planning and Urban Engineering*
 - MA Degree in Urban Management*
 - BA Degree in Integrated Urban Land Management and Information System*
 - MA Degree in Urban Infrastructure Provision and Management*
 - MA Degree in Urban Land Development and Management*
 - MA Degree in Environment, Climate Change and Urban Planning and Development*
- 3) Institute of Federalism and Legal Studies (IFLS) and Law specialized awards
 - MA Degree in Comparative Public Law and Good Governance and International Law MA*
 - Degree in Federalism and Local Governance*
- 4) Institutes of Tax and Customs Administration awards
 - BA Degree in Public Financial Management*
 - BA Degree in Tax and Customs Administration*
 - MA Degree in Public Financial Management*
 - MA Degree in Tax Administration and Customs Administration*
 - MA Degree in Public Purchase and Asset Management (in progress)*

Higher Education Relevance and Quality Agency

- 5) Institute for Certification of Accounts and Auditors (ICAA). This Institute is in the process of forming and organizing itself.
- 6) Institute of Continuing and Distance Education (ICDE) awards
 - BA Degree in Public Management (distance)*
 - BA Degree in Development Management (extension) BA*
 - Degree in Public Finance Management (extension) BA*
 - Degree in Urban Planning (extension)*
- 7) Institute of Leadership and Good Governance will award
 - MA Degree in Leadership and Good Governance*
- 8) Center for Public Policy Studies will award
 - MA Degree in Public Policy Studies (in progress)*

This center also has the responsibility for conducting research related to different policy issues.
- 9) The Graduate School is a new organ that will award:
 - PhD in Public Management*
 - PhD in Urban Planning and Development*
 - PhD in Public Financial Management*

Currently, the student body includes 3778 in the regular program; 731 in continuing education and 2990 in distance education. The total enrollment in the university is 7499. Nearly one third are Master's degree students in nine different fields of study. Over six thousand students are following Bachelor degree programs in Public Management through distance modality. Some five hundred are attending evening programs. The annual turn-over in course participants' including face to face, virtual, on-campus and in-plant has now reached over 10,000 students.

To discharge all its duties and responsibilities, ECSU comprises 218 local academic staff, 36 expatriate academic staff and 696 administrative support staff totaling 950. While some Ethiopian and expatriate academic staffs have qualifications of Masters or above, a substantial number of the teaching staff have only first degree. As a pioneer capacity building HEI in the country, ECSU strongly believes in building the capacity of its own human capital to effectively carry out its huge capacity building responsibilities. To this effect, the University has established the CAPD. This center is responsible for building the human capital of the University.

ECSU continually visits and revisits its services and programs and improves its overall systems. Since its establishment, the University has used a number of reform tools towards improving its core services so as to fulfill the demands of the civil service organizations. Prior to the BSC, the University implemented Business Process Re-engineering (BPR) in the four core processes and four support processes. Currently, ECSU is in the process of implementing a strategic management tool called BSC from 2003-2007 at a corporate level and cascading it down to subordinate units and individual performance level. In view of the fact that every change needs continuous follow up and improvement, each unit of the University is holding biweekly meetings to discuss problems encountered, share successes and make decisions based upon the practical application of the BSC.

The University has a Research, Publication Coordination Office (RPCO), which is accountable to VPAD. RPCO coordinates and facilitates the research and publications work of the University. Attention has been given to research aimed at problem solving. Annual conferences and seminars have been successfully held and proceedings and journals published. The University, in addition to its educational programs and research undertakings, provides short term trainings and consultancy services to civil service organizations across a broad spectrum of areas; mainly related to civil service reform programs and key government development areas. Other than in-house services, the University also provides training through Video-conferencing and E-learning using its well equipped DLC. The annual average number of participants in the short-term trainings of ECSU has reached well over 5000. The consultancy services of the University focus mainly on implementing different government initiated reforms. These are also increasing in quantity and quality.

Moreover, consultancy services assist public service organizations to effect institutional transformation. ECSU's consultants and lecturers have been providing consultancy services on the implementation of the civil service reform program underway in the country. Notable in this connection is the implementation of BPR and the BSC. In order to achieve efficiency and effectiveness in all its services within the context of a modern capacity building higher education institution focusing on the public service, the University has been implementing its BPR study.

The ECSU has several unique features which distinguishes it from other Higher Education Institutions. The first and most important one is that it focuses on specialized programs that are not offered in other higher education institutions, but are essential to fill the gaps in the civil service of the nation and are given utmost priority. The other distinguishing feature is that students joining both in its regular and continuing education programs have to be civil servants and all have to pass the entrance exam to join the University. In addition to providing and promoting access to learning opportunities, quality and relevant education programs to the public service, the University is working hard to foster social, cultural, and economic development through the application of knowledge, and practical skills on change management and reform understanding.

The University has grown from 400 students at its establishment to 7499 students. Now it has 254 full time instructors (218 local academic, 36 expatriate academic) including 36 female members of academic staff.

The Institutional Self Evaluation

The University formulated its Education Policy Guidelines in May, 2009. The Guidelines require the educational programs of ECSU to be well designed, regularly monitored and periodically reviewed through quality assurance. To this end, ESCU has formed a Quality Assurance Team under the Institutional Planning Assessment section to support and advise the University and to support the continuous improvement and enhance the quality of educational programs.

Based on HERQAs' ten focus areas, the Quality Assurance Team has developed a quality assurance handbook. The handbook describes the principles and procedures of ensuring the quality of education from inception of programs up to program evaluation. Moreover, a quality assurance committee was established in each institute led by the deputy director of the respective institute. The committee comprised all department heads together with student representatives and senior teachers in the institute. The Quality Assurance Handbook requires each institute of ECSU to carry out its internal quality audit and present its report. Before the preparation of the self-evaluation document at the institute level one-day training was given in University on HERQA procedure, focus areas and methods of internal quality audit and preparation of SED.

The University's self-evaluation followed a bottom-up approach. First, the institutes carried out their own self-evaluation with the support of the University Quality Assurance Team. Four of the institutes that are now running undergraduate and postgraduate educational programs, assessed the quality of their programs and submitted their SEDs to the University Quality Audit Committee. This committee was given the responsibility to conduct a quality audit at the University level, and prepare and submit the SED. Initially, the committee was divided further into three subcommittees. Having used the self-evaluation report of the institutes as a springboard, each subcommittee conducted a self-evaluation and produced a report on four focus areas. To this effect, they utilized different tools for gathering data during self-evaluation. All the activities were done intensively and meticulously.

The components of data gathering included:

- Questionnaire for Academic and Administrative Staff (Annex-3 of the SED),
- Questionnaire for Students (Annex-4 of the SED)
- Interview and Focus Group Discussion with Institute Directors, Department Heads and Quality Assurance Team
- Focus Group Discussion with Information Technology Services Head, IPA Head, Library and Information Head and General Service Head
- Interview with CAPD, top management and Institute Directors / Center Directors, Deputy Directors, Department Heads and other relevant personalities
- Focus Group Discussion with members of Student Council, Student Services Head and Institute Directors
- Document Analysis and Observation of Teaching

Higher Education Relevance and Quality Agency

- Visits were conducted to all institutes by the University level quality assurance committee to check the assertions through discussion with frontline users and workers.

All in all, the key inputs were gathered from senate members including the top management, institute directors, supportive core business process owners, students, student council, instructors and other relevant personalities. Following this, analysis of the data and write-up were carried out. The reports were integrated into one document.

After that, the SED was finalized by the University Quality Assurance Committee. It was then presented to the Senate for approval. The University Senate forwarded its comments and suggestions to be incorporated in the approved self-evaluation document. During this process, the University top management team facilitated the education quality audit as one of the senate's priorities.

The SED was devoted to an overview of the analysis of data from questionnaires, observations, and document analysis and interviews, which presented subjective data based on views and opinions.

The Institutional Quality Audit Process

The External Quality Audit team consisted of five members (see Appendix 2). Two members of the team had visited the University previously to undertake a briefing visit prior to the audit. During this briefing visit, the HERQA team explained the arrangements that would need to be made in preparation for the audit visit and talked through the additional information that the University should make available to the EQA team (see Appendix 5). The list of requested documents was left with the University. The briefing visit also discussed an outline of a timetable for the four-day audit. The responsibility for completing the audit timetable was left with the University. The importance of scheduling requested meetings and visits and informing selected staff and students who would be required to meet with the EQA team was reiterated to the ECSU management. The management was advised that it is important that the University community be well informed of the audit visit. This is the standard practice adopted by HERQA.

Prior to the arrival of the EQA team, the University put up two banners; one banner just immediately after the gate of the main door and the other banner in front of the gate of the student's dormitories to provide information about the upcoming Institutional Quality Audit. The University had prepared a base room for the audit team, collected many of the requested documents and prepared a timetable for the audit activities. The University planned meetings with numbers of staff drawn from the diverse segments of the institution. During the initial meeting with the University liaison officer, a request was made by the team for the ECSU to make some changes on the program of meetings and visits so that the EQA team could meet with additional staff and department heads.

The EQA team spent four days at the University. From the outset, the EQA team reported to the liaison officer assigned to facilitate the visit. The EQA team also announced its presence and their mission to the President. Just before the end of their visit, they gave a brief feedback report of their findings to the President. In addition to the meetings with the President, throughout the week, the team members had seventeen formal meetings with members of the staff, and one meeting with students. They also observed teaching in five classes and visited teaching facilities, staff offices, department heads' offices, the training and consultancy coordinator's office, the quality assurance team office, the guidance and counseling coordinator office, gender office, HRM office, video conferencing room, lounge, workshops, store, library, computer laboratories, registrar, cafeteria, dormitories, and recreational facilities. During visits, they talked with staff and students. In addition, the team studied documents and met together at least once during each day to discuss their findings and prepare for the next meetings.

The University did a lot to make the audit visit known to the University community. Despite the agreement made on a timetable, not all planned meetings went ahead. For example, the meeting with employers / board members was not carried out as per set time. Some meetings went ahead with fewer people than was desirable. A few staff members serve on more than one committee (e.g. institute directors, senate member and University level quality audit committee).

The Institutional Quality Audit

This section of the report presents the EQA teams' observations and views on each of the ten focus areas of the Institutional Quality Audit. Following a commentary on the focus area which was based on information provided in the SED and provided during the audit visit, each section summarizes commendations (if any) and recommendations. Recommendations are grouped into essential, advisable and desirable. Essential recommendations are actions that need urgent attention to assure quality and / or relevance. Advisable recommendations relate to areas where there is the potential for improved quality and/or relevance and where less urgent action is needed. Desirable recommendations are actions which will help to enhance quality and/or relevance.

1: Vision, Mission and Educational Goals

The vision and mission of the Ethiopian Civil Service University (ECSU) has been formulated and reformulated from the time of its birth in 1987 EC. to accommodate the changing demands of the country's civil service. Initially, as it was stated in the SED (page 1), the University was known as an Institute of Higher Education which had the core mission of producing and building capable civil servants for the nation's public service institutions. In the strategic plan of 2004-2008, the ECSU has developed four core Business processes, namely Education, Training, Research and Consultancy (SED page 6).

ECSU in its Strategic plan which was developed inline with the BSC (2010-14) reformulated its vision as "Excellence in Public Sector Capacity Building". The new vision does not include a timeline and /or extending its geographic boundary.

In the same document (page 7), the mission of the ECSU is reformulated as: "build the capacity of the public sector through education, training, research, consultancy and professional certification". The above changes in the areas of vision and mission clearly reveal that the University is in a dynamic process so as to cope with the prevailing shifts in the country.

The vision crafted in line with the BSC document highly correlates with one of the strategic themes which states: "Excellence in Academic and Professional Service for the Public Sector" (SED page 7). The SED also stated that the respective institutes, centers, and sections are required to draft and execute their level BSC to the attainment of the vision and mission of the University. The Legislation of Ethiopian Civil Service University November 2010, which is the main governing document of the University, does not contain the vision and mission of the University.

Other resources of the University where the vision, mission and objectives are stated are outlined as follows.

Five Year Strategic Plan 2010-2014 G.C stated as:

- Vision: Excellence in public sector capacity building
- Mission: Build the capacity of public sector through education, training, research, consultancy and professional certification services
- Core Values: Stakeholder focus, continuous learning, welcoming diversity, attention to the disadvantaged and commitment (page 8).

The vision, mission and values set at the corporate level are cascaded at the lower organs in the manner indicated as follows:

Public and External Relations Office

- Vision: To see a University where there is an efficient and effective flow of information both within and without.
- Mission: To help the University divisions or units in providing and seeking information effectively and efficiently within and without. To provide efficient services in the promotion of the activities of the University.

The vision also stated in the ECSC External & Public Relations Department Monthly Newsletter Jan.-Feb. 2011 vol.6, no.4 as follows:

- Our Vision: Excellence in Public Sector Capacity Building
- Our Mission: Building the capacity of the public sector through specialized education, training, research, consultancy and professional certification services
- Our Values: Customer focus, commitment, continuous learning, welcoming diversity, attention to the disadvantaged. (Monthly Newsletter March 2009 Vol. 4, No.1)

On the same Newsletter:

- ECSC's Vision: To become a center of excellence for building an effective, transparent and accountable civil service that contributes to the developments and transformation goal of Ethiopia.

Higher Education Relevance and Quality Agency

- ECSC's Mission: To organize and offer effective, efficient and problem solving programs in teaching, training, research and consultancy to build the capacity of the countrys' civil service.
- ECSC's Values: Quality in our service, customer satisfaction, commitment and innovation, effectiveness and efficiency in resource utilization, transparency and accountability, continuous learning.

Training Policy & Guidelines (May 2009) on the other hand stated the vision and mission of the University in the following manner:

- The Vision of the University is to become a center of excellence for building an effective, transparent and accountable civil service which contributes to the development and transformation goal of Ethiopia (page 2)
- Mission: The University has been mandated with improving the effectiveness, efficiency, transparency and accountability of the Ethiopian civil service on a continuous basis through: making ECSU a leading civil service institution exemplary in terms of effectiveness, efficiency, transparency and accountability in service provision: provision of training and specialized educational programs that cater for the needs of the civil service: training and certification of professionals.

Vision and mission statement is not included in the student handbook in the case of the Department of Development Management.

Training Policy & Guideline (2009) lists the aims of ECSU to attain the following important goals in education:

- Strengthen and capacitate civil service so as to efficiently and effectively address development efforts
- Bridge critical skilled manpower gap in specialized areas in the Ethiopian Civil Service sector in order to drive reform and development efforts
- Offer different undergraduate and postgraduate programs that produce competent graduates who can:
 - > Accomplish work-related tasks at high standards
 - > Solve all work-related problems by designing appropriate systems and solutions
 - > Play leadership roles in different sectors; and
 - > Work in teams effectively.

The ECSU has organized the External Public Relations Department of the University for the dissemination of information inside and outside the University.

The EQA team, through its meetings with the academic and administrative staff and students, realized that the ECSU adopted different mechanisms to disseminate its vision, mission and educational objectives. The mechanisms adopted to disseminate the vision and mission of the ECSU to internal and external stakeholders are stated as follows:

- A bi-lingual (English and Amharic) monthly Newsletter issued for internal consumption
- The quarterly Newsletter published every three months in English for external stakeholders
- Yearly issued postcards
- Out-look service in which inter office communications are made
- Posting printed vision, mission, values and goals in every office of the University (SED page 9).

In addition to the above publications, the ECSU also made known its vision, mission and values through the use of Institute handbooks, Graduation Bulletins, Students' Handbooks and through frequently disseminated leaflets. In the SED it was also stated that the ECSU is in the process of posting the vision and mission of the University. The dissemination channels were also confirmed by staff and students' respondents during different group discussion sessions conducted by the EQA.

The University has devised a new display method of disseminating information using 40 inch television screens and has also planned to launch a community radio program to disseminate relevant information and raise awareness to the nearby society of the University (SED page 9).

The students' representatives during a meeting confirmed that the vision and mission of the University are posted in every classroom. This was also confirmed by the EQA team during classroom observations.

In the BSC document (page 7) the core values are stated as:

- Stakeholders focus
- Continuous learning
- Welcoming diversity
- Attention to the disadvantaged
- Commitment

In the SED (page 5) it was stated that "the core values assist the academic and administrative staff members, students and stakeholders to be committed to the accomplishment of the University's' vision, mission and educational goals." The core values stated in the BSC document did not clearly communicate the real essence of the core values, which in fact reflect the existing guiding principles that show the behavior adopted by the community of the University. Instead the core values were stated as behavior to be achieved in the process of accomplishing the vision, mission and educational goals. The EQA also learned that the University utilizes the Institute handbook to disseminate the vision, mission and values. The representatives of the staff responded that the University uses two ways of disseminating the vision and mission of the University, namely: the University web-site and curriculum and brochures.

The University also conducted a survey through distributing questionnaires which ask respondents whether they know the vision, mission and values of the ECSU. According to the SED (page 10), 94% of the staff members and 60% students confirmed that they know the vision and mission of the University through the various means that the University has used.

Cross checking questions were also asked to measure the awareness of the staff and students in line with the vision, mission and educational objectives in which the levels of correct recall were found to be 87% and 99% respectively. In accordance with the SED (page 10), 91% of the staff and 72% of the student respondents confirmed the clarity of the vision, mission and educational goals.

In addition to the clear statement in the SED (page 11), students who participated in the Focus Group Discussion remarked students' lack of attention in recalling the vision, mission and educational goals; the drawback being the problem of dissemination of the vision, mission and educational goals. The above view of the students reveals that the different mechanisms adopted by the University to disseminate the vision, mission and values stated earlier, did not create awareness as expected by the University.

The EQA concludes that the University has clearly stated the mission and values which provide a concrete base for its existence. However, more is need to ensure that the vision and mission are inculcated in the minds and hearts of the University community at large. The team was of the opinion that the University needs to revisit its vision in line with its core strategic theme identified in the BSC document.

With Regard to Focus Area 1 (Vision, Mission and Educational Goals) the EQA team commends the University on the following:

- (i) The development of a vision, mission and strategic theme which is inspiring.
- (ii) The existence of well stated core values.
- (iii) The high level of communication of the vision, mission and core values.
- (iv) The development of a strategic plan.
- (v) The vision, mission and core values statements are center to meeting the special needs of the civil service.

The following are the recommendations of the EQA team on Focus Area 1 (Vision, Mission and Educational Goals):

A. Essential recommendations

Higher Education Relevance and Quality Agency

The EQA team recommends that the University:

- (i) inspires students' intrinsic feelings to make them aware of the vision, mission, goals and values of the University;
- (ii) includes its vision, mission and values in the University's Senate Legislation produced in the year 2010; the latest version addresses the issues;
- (iii) makes sure that the vision of the University has clear geographical boundaries and timeline for expansion / improvements;

B. Advisable recommendation:

The EQA team recommends that the University:

- (iv) establishes a system to check the awareness and implementation of its values by the University community;

C. Desirable recommendations

The EQA team recommends that the University:

- (v) monitors the progress in the realization of the vision, mission and goals.

2: Governance and Management System

The Legislation of the ECSU (2010) under article 3 clearly affirmed that the governance structure of the University, as declared in Higher Education Proclamation No. 650/2009. It states that "the University shall be governed by Board of Directors that shall be accountable to the Ministry of Civil Service" (SED page 11). The same document states that "the Board as the top authority of the University serves as a policy making and executive organ that is responsible for overseeing all major academic and administrative policies of the University." In line with the University establishment regulation No. 12/2006, the Board of Directors is appointed and is accountable to the Ministry of Civil Service (SED page 11).

According to the Council of Ministers' Regulation No.12/ 2006 the apex in the University ladder is occupied by the senate, which is chaired by the president of the University. The President and the two Vice-Presidents are appointed by the Prime Minister (Re-establishment, Council of Ministers Regulation No. 12/2006).

As to legislation of the University, the Senate is the highest body in the arena of academic matters that makes decisions regarding the academic rules and regulation of the University. The heads of departments during the discussion meetings also confirmed that the academic institutions are empowered to make decisions on all issues related to academic matters. The University has developed a system through which students could check their grade results if there is mismatch between acquired and expected grades.

With regard to regulation of the Senate Legislation (page 14), three standing committees are organized on a permanent basis, namely:

- Academic Standards and Curriculum Review Committee
- Research and Development Committee
- Academic Staff Promotion Committee and Ad Hoc Committee

The SED and the respondents during the group discussions confirmed that the new organizational structure is not well known (SED page 15). The SED tried to justify the reason by stating "this may be the introduction of new institutes and continuous restructuring to match fast moving changes in the University". The respondents during group discussions also confirmed that the structure of the University is fully manned in the administrative wing, whereas there are still gaps in the academic fields.

The respondents both from the side of staff and students were of the opinion that the system of governance is highly transparent and accountable. In support of the above argument, the following indicators were cited: the management works collectively and all concerned bodies are involved in decision making. Furthermore, two student council representatives are voting members of the Senate.

In addition to the above points, the Senate meetings' minutes and all decisions made are communicated to all lower units in the structure of the University. The respondents also assured the EQA team that the University uses the web-site as the mechanism to disseminate senate decisions which are public in nature, while private decisions are communicated to the concerned bodies on time. The University legislation clearly details the roles and responsibilities of all governing bodies and staff members.

According to the senate legislation and the group discussions with the EQA team, the president is empowered to assign institute Directors and Deputy Directors for three years of office tenure. The department heads on the other hand are assigned by the vice president for Academic Development as stated in the Senate Legislation (page 14).

The EQA team also learned from the discussion with the staff members and students that each institute has an Institutional Council which is composed of the heads of the Departments, staff representatives, students' representatives and the administrative support team leader. The respondents also confirmed that the department council comprises all fulltime academic staff members of the respective departments in the institutes and centers. The SED (page 13), contrary to the view of the respondents, stated that the participation of the students at the grassroots level is highly commendable. The SED and the opinion of discussion groups confirmed the representation of the students in the senate meeting with voting rights. The SED also reveals that students' participation was only once in four (1:4) meetings because several extraordinary meetings were held in the academic year which created an inconvenience for the students' representatives. The absence of student representation on the department council could be cited as a drawback in the implementation of the good governance in the ECSU.

The organogram which was included in the SED (page 66) clearly depicts the organizational structure of the ECSU. The University board holds the highest position in the hierarchy of the University. The ECSU has also senate members linked to the president in a lateral position. The EQA team learned from relevant documents that the structure of the ECSU has only four layers, which can be classified as a flat structure making the process of dissemination of information more efficient and effective (SED, page 66). According to the response of the discussion groups, various positions in the hierarchy were filled with essential manpower.

The University at the corporate level has its own governing body. The Governing body at the functional and business levels starts from the departments' heads and ends at the institution directors respectively. There is a clearly set organizational structure with duties and responsibilities of the different branches of the University. The University has well identified tasks of functional governing bodies.

The president is the chairperson of the senate and also chairperson of the management committee as cited Annex 2 in the SED (page 66).

The organogram of the University clearly indicates that nine offices are under the chain of command of the president: twelve offices are under VPAD and six offices are under Vice President for Business Development. The Management Support Services in the third wing is accountable to the president. Therefore, the offices under the domain of the president include Institutional Planning and Assessment, External Public Relations Department and Legal Services (SED page 66). At the corporate level there are three basic areas: the executive management group, the board and the president (SED page 66). The supreme authority of the University is the board.

Good governance in Higher Education Institutions is essential to promote efficiency and effectiveness, transparency, responsiveness and to create participatory ways of administration so as to achieve the objectives set out in the strategic plan. The involvement of students, instructors and management bodies in solving any problem in the delivery of the different programs reveals the presence of good governance.

According to the response of the discussion group members, the decisions made with the participation of concerned bodies in the University were disseminated through the hierarchy. The above reality also indicates the transparency of the management body in the realization of its objectives. The inclusion of duties and responsibilities of the governing bodies also indicates the transparency of the management system. The respondents in the group discussion stated that the University also clearly set out the procedures for appeal if anyone is not satisfied with the decisions made. The above condition also shows the presence of accountability if someone made a decision without following the rules and regulations. The presence of efficient and effective service delivery and accountability in using the institution's resources are also characteristics of good governance. The decisions made by the concerned bodies are available and communicated through the regular channels to all concerned beings. A transparent system adopted in the University is essential to ensure everyone is on board about what is going on in the University and to ensure that all participate in the process of implementation.

With the intention of satisfying the needs of various stakeholders and clients, ECSU has publicized different policy guidelines. The policy guidelines are also posted on the University website for public consumption. The main policy guidelines posted are;

- Education policy and guidelines
- Research policy and guidelines

Higher Education Relevance and Quality Agency

- Training policy and guidelines
- Consultancy policy and guidelines.

The availability of the policy guidelines and other relevant documents on website clearly indicates the high level of transparency in the governance University. The University legislation clearly describes the responsibilities different organs as follows:

the University system of the and duties of

Duties and responsibilities of the:

- Executive group /board/ presidents, Academic Vice President, Vice President for Business Development
- University senate
- University management committee
- Specialized and management support services
- Audit service
- Legal service
- Gender and development center
- HIV and AIDS management unit
- Institutional planning and assessment
- Public relation and marketing
- Ethics and liaison office
- Academic support service
- Center for academic and professional development
- Academic and professional development team
- Computing team
- Research and publication coordinating office
- Consultancy services
- Library and information services
- Admission and registration office
- Academic and structure

The University legislation also clearly stated the duties and responsibilities of Institutions in the following manner:

- Duties and responsibilities of Institute Director
- Duties and responsibilities of Program Manager
- Duties and responsibilities of Training Program Manager
- Duties and responsibilities of Educational Program Manager
- Duties and responsibilities of Consultancy Program Manager
- Duties and responsibilities of Research Program Manager

In chapter one of the legislation, under general provisions of the University senate, the different duties and responsibilities of the various organs were clearly stated. The above guiding document also contains duties and responsibilities of the following organs:

- The Executive Committee of the Senate
- Council for Graduate Programs
- The Academic Standards and Curriculum Review Committee
- The Library, Documentation and Information Technology Committee
- The Planning, Finance and Development Committee
- The Research and Publication Committee
- The Staff Appointments, Promotions, Development and Scholarship Committee

The EQA team concludes that the University has a well structured organogram and senate legislation that ensures a participatory way of management to support the achievement of the strategic goals of the University.

With regard to Focus Area 2 (Governance and Management System) the EQA team commends the University on the following:

- (i) The existence of an effective and very functional organizational structure
- (ii) The open door policy approach of the University leaders.
- (iii) The decentralized management structure and the establishment of a system that gives more decision-making power to Institute/ School.
- (iv) Securing equitable representation of students in all decision making structures through careful consideration of a convenient time framework for participation.
- (v) The working environment is conducive for the teaching and learning process.
- (vi) The development of a variety of important guidelines.
- (vii) The existence of a comprehensive set of job descriptions with clear roles and responsibilities.
- (viii) The maximum efforts exerted to implement BPR and BSC to reach the status of the University.

The following are the recommendations of the EQA team on Focus Area 2 (Governance and Management System):

A. Essential recommendations:

The EQA team recommends that the University:

- (i) seeks to address the deficiencies of some academic staff in certain specializations because of the unique nature of the programs offered in the University;
- (ii) takes account of gender in ensuring student representation in decision making organs at the academic commission and department levels;

B. Advisable recommendations

The EQA team recommends that the University:

- (iii) creates more opportunity for the awareness of the vision and mission of the University by the students and staff members;
- (iv) monitor the extent to which the values stated in the strategic planning documents are reflected in the behavior of the University community at large;

C. Desirable recommendations

The EQA team recommends that the University:

- (v) considers developing a more comprehensive staff handbook at all institutes/schools.

3: Infrastructure and Learning Resources

The existence of sufficient physical facilities, such as office accommodation, classrooms, lecture halls, and learning resources, libraries, laboratories, workshops, computer centers, access to the internet, are the cornerstones for higher education institutions and good indicators for the quality of services they provide. This section of the report draws on the outcomes of a number of meetings with staff and student representatives, the study of documentation, observation of

Higher Education Relevance and Quality Agency

teaching and visits to the facilities at the University. The information provided in the SED has been also considered for fair comparison.

Classrooms

Ethiopian Civil Service University (ECSU) has its own complex of buildings on two campuses in Addis Ababa. The main campus is located at CMC and the branch campus is located at Kotebe. The Kotebe campus is partially owned by the Ethiopian Electric Power Corporation (EEPCO). It serves only for Institute of Urban Development Studies. The SED (page 12-13) states that the classrooms have an adequate amount of space to accommodate all students for the courses offered at each institute. There are sufficient chairs and desks for students, a table for instructors, windows for natural light and ventilation, sufficient electric light and connections, black and whiteboards. The classroom to student ratio at the University level is 1:35.

During the visits, the EQA team confirmed that the classrooms at both campuses can adequately accommodate 35 students. Moreover, the team observed trainee accommodation, training halls, theater rooms and facilities, syndicate rooms and meeting/conference rooms which are well furnished with the necessary facilities.

The EQA team observed that while all the classrooms at the main campus are equipped with green boards, white boards, and notice boards, the classrooms at the Kotebe Campus are equipped with either a green chalkboard or both green chalkboard and white marker boards. However, none of them were equipped with overhead/LCD projectors. During the classroom visit, the EQA team observed the Instructor using LCD at IUDS. During discussion, senior staff pointed out the existence of laptops, LCD and overhead projectors at institute level to be used by instructors upon their request.

The EQA team is of the view that the classroom accommodation is satisfactory for current needs. The team also attested that the general condition of the classrooms on both campuses was excellent. All the classrooms visited by EQA team were very clean, tidy, and suitable for the purpose of instruction, however, the EQA team observed the need for maintenance of doors in some classrooms and the need for improvement of the sanitation of toilets at the Kotebe Campus. It was observed that offices and classroom facilities are not suitable for students with disabilities.

During discussion with senior staff members of IUDS, they acknowledged the need for maintenance of the overall IUDS campus facilities but raised the difficulty of undertaking maintenance due to the lack of ownership of the campus. The EQA team was briefed by the senior staff members of IUDS about the future master plan of the University's expansion program, to be implemented when the legal question of ownership of the IUDS campus is settled.

Office Accommodation

The University has made offices available for top managers and department heads, however, most other academic staff members share common rooms with a group of 3-6 permanent academic staff depending on the size of the office. The University also provides offices for part-time staff. Internet access is available in all offices of the main campus and partially in the IUDS campus.

While not mentioned in the SED, in some cases, the EQA team observed a shortage of offices for academic staff especially in IUDS campus. In most other cases, the offices are well furnished but lack bookshelves. A shortage of office accommodation has meant that many members of staff have no private area for preparation and marking, student advice or to meet with students seeking academic counseling. This poses a problem for individual tutoring and counseling of students. During discussion this concern was also reflected by top managers of the University.

The EQA team is of the view that while it may not be practical to provide every staff member with a private office, the University needs to consider ways in which it can provide conducive work areas for staff and also private areas where staff can meet with students.

ICT Access

With the world moving rapidly into digital media and information, the role of ICT in education is becoming more and more important. The existence of well functioning ICT at higher education institutions is an essential tool for prompt information exchange among all staff and students. It helps update them in a fast growing information age and provides access to explore academic and other sources of information on the web.

The EQA team was informed by staff members of the ICT service that, Internet service is provided to the University community on the main and IUDS campuses. On the main campus,

internet services are provided through reliable optical fiber 40MB bandwidth. There are 13 laboratories, having a total of about 300 computers which are providing internet services for both undergraduate and graduate students. Recently wireless internet connection has been made available in the University. The EQA team also noted that there is a central IT unit that provides services to the University community. The center provides a desktop support system and network operation, website administration, training, coaching and software training to students and staff based on their needs. The IT unit also has a separate center that offers quick maintenance service on request. During the interviews conducted with staff and student representatives, the EQA team learned that students have relatively little computing experience and that a greater level of IT literacy training and support is required from the IT unit.

The EQA team observed that, the University has ample ICT facilities on the main campus, while there is still a need to tackle the shortage of ICT facilities at Kotebe Campus. Through discussions with students, it was also noted that there is a need to consider timely upgrading and maintenance of all old computers as there are some computers which are not functioning. The University needs to encourage students to use the web to access academic resources. There is also a need to produce manuals for guiding the learning experience in computer laboratories.. As a result of the campus tour and interviews with students, the team generally acknowledges the efforts made by ECSU in providing a range of effective IT services, especially on the main campus.

The SED (page 15) states that the University has a plan to expand broadband internet (both wired and wireless) connection for the rest of buildings of IUDS. When this plan goes operational, the EQA team hopes that the shortage of the ICT facilities at the IUDS will be solved within a short period of time.

Laboratories

The SED (page 13) states that there are engineering and language laboratories in the University. There are three engineering laboratories located at the IUDS campus; the soil and material laboratory, the GIS laboratory and the surveying laboratory. Of these, the surveying laboratory is in a good situation with up-to-date instruments, except for the limited number of GPS and total station instruments due to the high cost of the device. The GIS lab is available in the IUDS for students of urban engineering & urban planning departments. The soil and material laboratory is not fully functional. It can only be used to perform simple material tests due to the lack of appropriate equipment and important materials. The language laboratory has a video and audio input, and it can hold 48 students. The language laboratory is currently serving 5 sections which have on average 35 students per section.

The EQA team observed that students were working in the GIS and surveying laboratories to practice their assignments. They were undertaking their group activities with a positive spirit in a mini- room. Examples of the students work were demonstrated in the mini-rooms and in the library. Overall, the engineering laboratories are well-equipped and functioning effectively. The other laboratories require materials like GPS, total station instruments and appropriate equipment and important materials for the soil and material laboratory to operate effectively.

Libraries

The Library supports the teaching, learning, research and consultancy activities of Higher Education Institutions by providing relevant books and other resources in hard and/or soft copy. The Ethiopian Civil Service University has libraries on both campuses. The SED (page 14) states that the libraries have excellent spacious buildings, each of which accommodates over 400 students at a time, with a collection of over 40,000 books, 10,000 documents (journals, reference materials, and magazines), 65,000 electronic resources, Braille, Compact Disc (CD) and audio materials.

Each library has circulation, reference, periodicals and documentation sections, thereby providing effective and efficient services. In addition, each library provides services for users with special needs: visually impaired are accommodated in a separate room designed for this purpose with resources in Braille and computer facilities. Moreover, this library provides service to approximately 10 users per day from different institutions through the inter-library loan agreement and also for users from various civil service offices. The libraries provide 24 hours service daily , except national holidays and the annual inventory. During the term breaks, the service is available from Monday to Friday (8:30 am-5:00 pm) (SED page 14). During the interviews held with staff and students, the EQA team heard about the high levels of satisfaction of the University community with the library services. The EQA team also noted this claim during the visit of facilities.

From the visit to the libraries, the EQA team noted that the library service, in general, is adequate in terms of availability of required books and space for reading.and the team admired

Higher Education Relevance and Quality Agency

the computer services (specially designed software(Jaws) provided to visually impaired students. The libraries employ a card index and computerized catalogue system for organizing its' resources. The library system has its own website and users have access to the Online Public Access Catalog (OPAC). A web-based catalogue allows remote searching of the library's collections. A computerized issue system has also been introduced. These are up-to-date and in a state of ongoing development that illustrates the commitment of the library to providing efficient and effective support for students and staff. It is the view of EQA team that some (if not many) users may not use the OPAC system due to lack of awareness of its existence and computer skills. The OPAC manual is produced in a leaflet form; although more effort is required to inform users through orientation and training about the application, OPAC.

The libraries provide a range of services that include a spot reading service, loan service, and Internet service. There are an adequate number of computers inside the libraries to provide internet services for students. The libraries on both campuses apply an open stack system. The EQA team views this as a good way of encouraging the use of the library. Apart from the open stack service in which readers directly access publications, a few copies of text and reference books are reserved at a circulation desk to be checked out by students for a limited period of time. These services are provided by 61 library staff. The chief librarian holds a masters degree, 8 members of staff have bachelor degrees, 40 have diplomas and the remaining 12 are grade 10+/12+. The entrance of the main library is at ground level, making it accessible for students with disabilities.

The EQA team noted that the library has an earmarked annual budget (birr 2,000,000) for the purchase of books. The team was informed that new books are purchased for the library based on the recommendations of staff from different institutes. Sometimes new programs are launched even though there is no minimum library stock which can support staff and students. This calls into question the system for approving the launch of programs that does not ensure that sufficient resources are in place. There are no book shortages. In full capacity the library can accommodate 800 readers at a time. A postgraduate students' library exists with a well-documented MSc thesis of students.

Development Learning Center

ECSU has a DLC which facilitates video conference. It is available for defense, discussion programmes and short term training, e-learning, graduate' paper defense etc. It was reported to the EQA team up until now, about 10, 000 people have benefited from it. The EQA team was informed that so far, only 13 countries in Africa have made use of this technology.

Teaching Aids

Black/ green boards and/or whiteboards are available in every classroom. During the observation of teaching in IUDS, the EQA team could see the instructor was supporting the lecture by using an LCD. The SED (page 12) states that at institute level, there are LCD projectors, overhead projectors and laptops for the teaching and learning process so that instructors can use audiovisual materials if they wish. Equipment in the program office includes a computer with a printer; examination duplicating machine; and photocopy machine. The SED indicated that ECSU has an organized system of learning resource maintenance and updating.

Adequacy of Budget and Financial Stability

The financial stability of the University and a sufficient budget to achieve its mission and vision, and to run and sustain its programs was not addressed thoroughly in the SED. From discussion with senior staff and board members, the EQA team learned that generally, there are no financial constraints for ECSU in managing its programs. The University has its own income source from fees for short-term trainings offered; however, this income is incorporated into the total budget of the University allocated by the Ministry of Finance and Economic Development (MOFED). The total budget allocated for the year 2003 EC was 107,631,231Birr (internal income=31,519,600, from government treasury= 76,111,631). From this, the University expends 95% of the allocated budget during the given budget year. During the discussion with top management, the need for more budget control in the future was discussed and as it has already been upgraded to University level. Based on the information provided, the EQA team has no reason to doubt the financial stability and viability of the University.

With regard to Focus Area 3 (Infrastructure and Learning Resources) the EQA team commends the University on the following:

- (i) The location and adequacy of reading space of the library, the quality of its library holdings and the provision of efficient and sufficient services to its staff and students.
- (ii) The digital /Computerized/ catalogue system of the library.
- (iii) The well maintained classrooms, laboratories, dormitories and other facilities.

- (iv) The availability of reading rooms for female students near to their dormitory.
- (v) Access to broadband and wireless internet connection for all staff and students.
- (vi) The availability of well-equipped diverse training and conference halls.
- (vii) Existence of well functioning maintenance, repair and cleaning services.
- (viii) The elegant, clean and green main campus.

The following are the recommendations of the EQA team on Focus Area 3 (Infrastructure and Learning Resources)

A. Essential recommendations

The EQA team recommends that the University:

- (i) improves the provision of office accommodation for staff especially in IUDS campus;
- (ii) improves the ICT facilities on the IUDS campus;
- (iii) encourages and supports students to take the opportunity of using the web to utilize plenty of academic resources;

B. Advisable recommendations

The EQA team recommends that the University:

- (iv) furnish academic staff offices with shelves and other facilities;
- (v) reconsider the provision of laboratory materials on the IUDS;

C. Desirable recommendations

The EQA team recommends that the University:

- (vi) makes known the availability of the Online Public Access Catalog (OPAC) system to all students by providing more orientation programs and library instruction classes provides more IT support training for students.

4: Academic and Support Staff

In any higher education institution, the quality of education offered is dependent upon the quality of its teaching staff and student support. The academic staff should have suitable qualifications, sufficient knowledge, plenty of skill, great attitude, exciting habits and unreserved efforts to deliver effective and efficient teaching in order to get desired learning outcomes. For this reason, there is a need to recruit an adequate number of staff with the desired match of qualification and experience to teach and carry out other duties and responsibilities. To achieve this, staff recruitment and appointment procedures should be directed towards selecting sufficient and appropriate staff to ensure a high level of educational standards. Due to this fact finding mission, the HEIs are requested to provide information on staffing in their SEDs as a result of which both the HEI and the EQA team can assess the appropriateness of staffing for the activities of the HEI, in particular the programs that are being offered.

Academic Staff

The Ethiopian Civil Service University's educational program operates with the collaboration of full-time and part-time Ethiopian instructors and full-time expatriate staff. At the time of the audit, Ethiopian Civil Service University had a total of 254 full-time academic staff (Table 4.1). Among this number, 218 (187 male and 31 female) are Ethiopian full-time academic staff with a range of qualifications. The University has also a total of 36 (31 male and 5 female) expatriate staff with a range of qualifications.

Table 4.1: Full-time, Ethiopian and Expatriate Staff by Qualification and Gender

	First degree		Second degree		PhD Study Leave		PhD		Academic staff by qualification, sex & citizenship		
	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F	Total
Ethiopian	27	11	103	18	29	2	28	-	187	31	218
Expatriate	-	-	17	3	-	-	14	2	31	5	36
Total	38		141		31		44				254

Higher Education Relevance and Quality Agency

With regard to qualifications, the University has 38 first degree holders, 141 MA/MSc/LLM degree holders and 44 PhD holders on work (Table 4.2). From the information in the SED and the discussions held with senior management personnel, directors, deans, department heads, senior and junior academic staff and other support staff, it would appear that, in general, the number of teaching staff and their qualifications in all fields of study are quite commensurate with the educational policy of the University to effectively carry out the day-today teaching and learning process that has been going on this far.

Table 4.2 Full-time Academic Staff Profile by Qualifications

Qualifications	Number	Percentages
First Degree	38	14.96
Second Degree	141	55.51
PhD	44	17.33
PhD (study leave)	31	12.20
Total	254	100.00

Among the total number of academic staff, the University claims to have 59% lecturers, 15% assistant professors, 3.5% associate professors and 2% professors (Table 4.3). The mix is reasonably fair to conduct the expected teaching /learning process.

The EQA team was informed that the maintenance of quality education in the Ethiopian Civil Service University was heavily supported by the enormous role played by professors from Europe, the Far East, the United States, Australia, Canada, China and African countries in shaping the University by educating in every respect, to include financial and other forms of assistance. Besides these, expatriate staff serves the University as heads' of departments. They also make the University conscious of its weaknesses and indicate its strengths.

The SED further indicates that the staff-student ratio is 1:15, a figure which favorably exceeds the figure stipulated by the Ministry of Education.

The expatriate staff have provided significant service to the University including active participation in recent changes and the University's different activities. It is worth mentioning here, that in a developing country like Ethiopia where education is of primary concern, the art and technique of exploring possibilities for obtaining financial and other forms of aid, very much depends upon the authorities who are leading higher education institutions of learning in the country. The continuous effort that the president of the Ethiopian Civil Service University has made in this regard is highly commendable.

Table 4.3 Full time and expatriate academic staff profile by rank and program

Institute/ Center	Department	Academic Rank									Total
		Graduate	Assistant	Associate	Consultant	Assistant	Lecturer	Assistant Professor	Associate Professor	Professor	
IPMDS	Economics	-	-	-	-	-	6	5	-	-	11
	Development Management	-	-	-	-	2	10	3	-	-	15
IUDS	Urban Planning	5	-	-	-	4	15	1	1	-	26
	Urban Eng.	4	-	-	-	5	9	-	-	-	18
	UMMP	-	-	-	-	-	27	7	2	4	40
ITCA	PFM	-	-	-	-	-	5	2	-	-	7
	Tax and Customs Administration	-	-	-	-	1	12	3	-	-	16
	Public Procurement and Asset Management	-	-	-	-	-	4	-	-	-	4
IFLS		-	-	-	-	4	5	4	1	14	
ICAA		-	1	-	-	2	-	-	-	3	
ICDE		1	-	-	-	19	1	-	-	21	
ILG		-	-	-	-	3	4	-	-	7	
CPPS		-	-	-	-	3	1	-	-	4	
CTC		-	3	-	7	4	1	-	-	15	
CAPD		-	-	-	-	13	5	2	-	20	
Library		-	1	-	-	2	-	-	-	3	
RPCO		-	-	-	-	2	-	-	-	2	
ARO		-	-	-	-	1	-	-	-	1	
IPA		1	-	-	-	2	3	-	-	6	
DLC		-	-	-	1	2	-	-	-	3	
IT		3	-	-	-	1	4	-	-	8	
External and Public Relations Department		-	-	-	-	1	-	-	-	1	
HAMU		-	-	-	1	1	1	-	-	3	
CGAD		-	-	-	-	3	-	-	-	3	
HRM		-	-	-	-	-	1	-	-	1	
Finance		-	-	-	-	1	-	-	-	1	
Student services		-	-	-	-	-	1	-	-	1	
Total		14	5	9	23	151	38	9	5	254	

Source: External Public relation office (ECSC, April 2010/2011) cited in SED

Table 4.4 Postgraduate and Undergraduate Student to Staff Ratio by Institutes, Programs/ Departments and Sex

Name of Institutes	Name of Departments/Programs	Number of students		Total	Number of Staffs	Ratio	Remark
		M	F				
IPMDS	Development Economics (MA)	52	16	68	8	1:9	
	Development Management (BA)	328	45	373	16	1:23	
IUDS	Urban Planning (BSc)	271	30	301	27	1:11	
	Urban Engineering (BSc)	254	17	271	20	1:14	
ITCA	Public Financial Mgt (BA)	152	35	187	9	1:21	
	Tax and Custom Adm .(BA)	132	76	208	11	1:19	
	Public Financial Mgt (MA)	51	18	69	3	1:23	
	Tax Administration (MA)	27	4	31	4	1:8	
	Custom Administration (MA)	7	-	7	3	1:2	
IFLS	Law (LLM)	51	13	64	4	1:16	
	Federalism & Local Government Studies (MA)	43	2	45	3	1:15	
At University level		1368	256	1624	108	1:15	

Source: External Public relation office (ECSC, April 2010/2011) cited in SED

Administrative Support Staff

The administrative staff of the Ethiopian Civil Service University work in four sections. These are:-

- 1) The Procurement, Finance, Property Management section which takes care of all the activities of procurement, finance and property of all business processes.
- 2) The Human Resource Management section which takes care of human resource business and assists top managerial business units of the University in relation to HR activities
- 3) The Students' Services section which is engaged in the overall activities related to boarding, laundry, lodging, catering, recreation and health-related services for the students.
- 4) The General Services section which comprises the campus security guard service, transport service, technical and maintenance service, printing and duplication service and takes care of management, development and maintenance of the University campus in order to ensure a healthy environment for the University community to study, work and live.

Table 4.5 Current Administrative Staff by Qualification and Gender

Academic Qualification	Academic Year 2003			Remark
	Male	Female	Total	
Second degree	4	-	4	216 (professional Administration staff)
First degree	26	23	49	
Diploma	62	101	163	480 (non- professional Administration staff)
Certificate	45	116	161	
Others	121	198	319	
Grand Total	258	438	696	

The University has adequate numbers of administrative support staff. Their qualifications are modest. As the above Table (4.5) illustrates, the majority (62.9%) of support staff (both professional administration staff and non professional staff) are females. This demonstrates an effort to empower females by giving them more access to employment. . The University should be commended with regard to their efforts.

The ratio of total number of academic staff to total number of professional administrative staff is 1 to 1:18 which is satisfactory in running the program properly. The SED (page 20) states that support staff have a vital contribution to make in supporting the teaching / learning business of the University. The adequate number of support staff facilitates the smooth and effective functioning of the teaching/ learning process. The administrative support staff facilitates all core business: teaching, research, training and consultancy which are commendable practices for effective functioning.

Academic Staff Recruitment and Appointment

To effectively discharge its duties and responsibilities, the Ethiopian Civil Service University heavily relies upon the strength of its professional staff. This is done by means of a clear and transparent policy that has been developed regarding employment, upgrading and other rights of the staff of the University. This is based upon the rules and regulations of the University.

The SED (page 21) states that employment for any academic position at ECSU is on a contract basis. The academic staff recruitment and appointment are carried out based on the rules and regulations of the University. However, the shortage of professionals in the fields of engineering and architecture has necessitated the appointment of part-time instructors.

Academic Staff Appraisal

In the past, the evaluation of staff was based upon an evaluation criteria developed to measure the teaching performance of instructors. It was this criterion which students had to follow in order to evaluate the teaching performance of their instructors. Recently, however, the discussion meeting of the EQA team with senior academic and other administrative staff, as well as information in the SED, has testified that the academic staff appraisal has been based upon a fair and overall percentage assessment methodology conducted by 3 parties, namely students, department chairperson and colleagues in the ratios 50%, 30% and 20% respectively. As far as the Ethiopian Civil Service University is concerned, this instructors' appraisal mechanism is believed to be an appropriate performance evaluation methodology intended to assess every instructor from various perspectives. The SED (page 21) disclosed that all the institutes of ECSU have started implementation of BSC and its performance appraisal techniques.

Academic Staff Promotion

The criteria which the Ethiopian Civil Service University has been following in its academic staff promotion are based upon the following legislation policy.

- 1) The academic qualification of the member of staff and his/her experience
- 2) Effective years of teaching and research work and preparation of publications
- 3) Active participation in University activities
- 4) Good academic performance in accordance with the evaluation of students and staff
- 5) Services rendered to the University community such as consultancy services, supporting research and training programmes

The process of academic staff promotion includes:

- Department heads, after consulting with the department council, recommend an academic staff member for promotion
- Recommendations from the department are submitted to the institute director
- The institute director presents the case to the institute council
- The director of the council submits a written request for approval of the promotion to the VPAD
- The VPAD will present the case to the senate promotion standing committee where the case is very thoroughly investigated for decision

If there is any dissatisfaction based on evidence regarding the recommendation by the department head, the academic staff member has the right to present his/her complaint to the Department Council. The limitations regarding the academic staff promotion arrangements as stated in the SED and voiced by staff include: lack of published article in a reputable journal; not being a member of the academic institute but of the management/administrative support team.

Support Staff Recruitment and Promotion/Appointment

Under administrative staff, one of the business processes at corporate level is Human Resource Management. One of the duties and responsibilities of this section is to manage the HR aspects of the University. This includes staff recruitment, appraisal, and promotion/appointment. The support staff recruitment, appraisal and promotion are carried on according to the rules and regulation of the Civil Service Ministry of the country.

The University recognized that the tasks of support staff have invaluable support for implementation of teaching / learning core activities of the institution. Moreover, support staffs participate in decision-making processes in the academic councils of the institutes. The appraisal and promotion is indispensable for a smooth workflow and continuous development.

Academic Staff Development

The information in the SED as well as the discussion held with senior University staff and administrative personnel has indicated that a dependable human development policy exists in the University which comprises pedagogy training to improve the teaching methodology of the entire academic staff and short-term training facilities. An instance may be cited where a graduate assistant will not be assigned to teach directly by himself/herself until a period of 1 year. Later he/she will be allowed to teach normal and common courses after he/she gets familiarized with the art of teaching. This is clearly shown in the 5 year strategic plan pamphlet set out by the Ethiopian Civil Service University as a good guideline directed towards 3 purposes: planning aspect, construction aspect as well as evaluation aspect.

Following a long-term staff development strategic plan, the Ethiopian Civil Service University has scholarship opportunities for PhD and MSc programmes in Ethiopia and other Universities abroad. In support of this staff development policy of the University, at present 23 participants are on PhD study leave which constitutes 9% of the teaching staff, a figure which is rather high. Moreover, long-term educational programmes and short-term training facilities are also offered to deserving administrative staff members of the University.

In order to effectively manage the responsibility of academic staff in relation to teaching and assessment, the University organized various trainings and meetings to orient staff on the design and implementation of the newly designed core processes, especially the education business process. The trainings given included an in depth discussion on the University policy of the core

business processes of the University including education, research, training and consultancy. Three rounds of two days training each were offered in the town of Adama with regard to teaching and learning (Course Design, Student Centered Teaching Approach, and Learning Assessment).

For the implementation of an effective and efficient staff development scheme, ECSU has established a separate unit called the "CAPD". CAPD strives to build the academic and professional capacities of undergraduate and postgraduate students, the academic and administrative support staff of the University and external customers from the civil service sector through education, research, training and special support services with the view of significantly contributing to the achievement of the grand mission of the University. The center is headed by a director accountable to the Academic Vice President of the University. The Internal Capacity building programs include

- English language and communication short term trainings for the staff
- Research Methodology trainings for the academic staff and students
- Teaching Methodology trainings for the academic staff
- Students performance evaluation techniques trainings for the academic staff
- Basic computer skills trainings for the staff and the students
- Professional skills development trainings for the administrative support staff in their respective areas of responsibility
- Monitoring and evaluation
- Participating in the university's curriculum development and review
- Carrying out action research on teaching / learning activities

CAPD is staffed with highly experienced members who are PhD and Master's degree holders and have many years of University teaching and research experience. The EQA team implicitly noted that the University has established an entrenched system for staff development. There is sound achievement on this task. The EQA team was impressed by the opinions of staff and observations of various documents regarding staff development. The staff development workshop series conducted in April (2011) showed that over 40 members *of staff in two rounds attended training on*

- *Overview of Learner-Centered Teaching*
- *Learner Centered Approaches, Methods and Techniques*
- *Continuous Assessment*

An in house capacity building training programme for staff, scheduled to be conducted from January 25, 2011- February 20, 2011, 2012 included

- Learner-Centered Teaching Approach
- Learning Assessment, Marking and Grading
- Course Planning and Reviewing
- Task Design & Classroom Management issues
- Presentation Skills
- Action Research and Research Skills
- Academic Leadership Skills
- Leading and Implementing BSC Plan
- Internship, Service-Learning, Extended Programme
- Basic Computer Skills

- Language, Communication and Office Management
- Statistical tools with packages

The other capacity building training offered in 2003 EC comprised

- Induction
- Learner Centered Teaching approach
- Lecture on Quality assurance
- Gender Concepts and its Global and National Legal Framework
- Communication and assertiveness skill
- Student Information System

Support Staff Development

The University offers training to its support staff. The "training need request" forms filled and submitted show that the various institutes request training support for their support staff in the following area:

- Computer: MS-Word; Excel; Publisher; Access; Power Point; SPSS (Statistical Package for Social Sciences)
- Record Management
- Property Management
- Cash Management
- Time Management
- Balanced Scorecard

With regard to Focus Area 4 (Academic and Support Staff) the EQA team commends the University on the following:

- (i) The establishment of the Center for Academic and Professional Development for effective implementation of staff development.
- (ii) The existence of a considerable number of highly qualified expatriate staff.
- (iii) The existence of a well established staff appraisal system.
- (iv) The effort exerted to upgrade its staff at PhD level.
- (v) The provision of pedagogical training to its teaching staff.
- (vi) The provision of job specific training to its administrative staff.
- (vii) The creation of a development learning center / video conferencing.

The following are the recommendations of the EQA team on Focus Area 4 (Academic and Support Staff)

A. Essential recommendations

The EQA team recommends that the University:

- (i) enhances the academic profile of graduate assistant further;
- (ii) increases the number of staff in critically understaffed areas;
- (iii) increase the number of female academic staff of the University;
- (iv) seeks ways to attract staff members with PhD degrees;

B. Advisable recommendation

The EQA team recommends that the University:

- (v) makes use of staff appraisal to identify training needs;

- (vi) develops and strengthen a promotion structure and career pathway for administrative staff;
- (vii) investigates the teaching loads of academic staff; and devise a strategy to use the maximum load of the staff for more efficient student learning;

C. Desirable recommendations

The EQA team recommends that the University:

- (viii) maintains the use of expatriate staff.

5: Student Admission and Support Services. Student Admission

Any higher education institution should have a transparent admission policy and provide adequate and efficient support services to maintain effective implementation of its teaching-learning programmes. The EQA team held successive discussions with the University's Vice Presidents, Institute Directors, Deans, Department Heads, Senior Staff and University Registrar and students' council, students, academic staff and administrative support staff in order to verify the findings of the University's SED about student admission. In Legislation (page 33, Article 27: 27.2.10) and in the SED (page 23) it is stated that students who want to join ECSU should be civil servants. The admission policy of the University for the undergraduate day and extension programmes required the completion of the 12th grade with a minimum GPA of 2.00 in the Ethiopian School Leaving Certificate Examination (ESLCE). Alternatively, candidates who have completed preparatory school; hold a diploma in a relevant field with a minimum CGPA of 2.00; or who are recommended by the capacity building/Civil Service bureau of regional states or concerned federal government offices are also considered. All candidates must pass the entrance examination of the University to ascertain the candidate's inclination towards his choice of specialization. Students are enrolled base on these first choices.

The EQA team also noted that to be eligible for entry into the postgraduate programmes, the candidate should have a bachelor's degree in the desired field of study from a recognized college or university, and should pass entrance examinations. A service period of 2 years after receiving the first degree and an age limit of not more than forty-five years is the requirement.

Student Support Services

It is well understood that students in HEIs should be supported in different ways during their stay at the institutions as well as after completion of their study program if it is found necessary. The Ethiopian Civil Service University provides student support services including academic counseling, advisory, tutorial, guidance and counseling. It provides dormitory accommodation, offers health services, a cafeteria service, and recreational facilities for all students. Ultimately, all these services help students to attain their educational goals. The EQA team held discussions with the student council, Director for Student Services, Head of Health Clinic, Head of guidance and counseling, Head of gender office, University Quality Audit Team. The EQA team made a site visit to verify what is stated in SED regarding student's support services. The findings pertaining to student support services are covered in the following sections.

Academic Consultation

With regard to academic consultation programs it was noted that the University advices, guides and supports students by offering 3 hours of consultation per week for each semester, a figure which is rather high when compared to other higher education institutions of learning. The practices vary among institutes. The experience of assigning instructors to advise 10-15 freshman students on different academic issues on a permanent basis is reported to be exercised in some institutes. This is a good practice because the incoming students want to know about the overall aspects of HEIs. It is obvious that, the more information in the form of advice offered to freshman students, the higher their success rate.

Major challenges so far identified regarding academic consultation include:

- Lack of information or awareness on the part of students on the kind of services they can get from an academic consultation
- Lack of commitment and courage from students in approaching their teacher for consultation

- An erroneous perception that outstanding students do not need academic consultation
- In some instances the instructors may not avail themselves as per scheduled consultation hours
- Absence of any effective monitoring of the implementation of academic consultation and its impact

There are academic advisors assigned for a group of students from the program of studies under the department to provide an additional source of help, guidance and support in the academic pursuits of students requiring such support in addition to those provided by the normal channels. They are mandated to identify students with academic problems, to advise students on senior research projects.

Tutorial Services

The SED (page 24) reveals that most institutes of ECSU offer tutorial services. This good practice was also noted by participants during the discussion with staff and students. It was made clear that the University has identified those students who require special academic support based upon students' gender, region and academic performance. In regard to tutorial services, weaknesses have been identified and subsequent recommendations made in order to improve quality assurance.

Challenges encountered with respect to tutorial services include:

- Absence of any mechanism to follow up and evaluate the results or the progress made through tutorial services
- Lack of coordination of tutorial services institutionally
- Lack of commitment from some students to devote their time to the tutorial program
- Students fear of stigmatization and labeling if they attend the tutorial service as it might be perceived as a result of weak performance

Guidance and Counseling

According to the SED (page 24-25) *"the University does not employ formal counseling and guidance services that should be given by a psychologist. According to the Director of Student Services, unlike other HEI,, guidance and counseling should be given within a team approach by HIV and AIDS management unit, Center of Gender and Development and a professional doctor in the University clinic which is organized by a student Dean"*.

On the other hand, from the discussion held with staff who are associated with student counseling and student representatives, it was made clear to the EQA team that the University runs student counseling through a well-established Guidance and Counseling office. The head of the office has the qualification of a Masters Degree in Measurement and Evaluation. At the time of the audit, the EQA team visited the office of the coordinator and observed a draft guideline which is being prepared to provide the service of guidance and counseling. The office has had a plan to provide full advisory services on psychological, social, economical and behavioral issues. The EQA team has seen a well-stated action plan for 2004 annual plan of the Guidance and Counseling Office. The major purpose of the plan includes:

- Improve academic success of students through orientations
- Reduce students' psychological problems that affect their academic success through advice
- Improve the confidence level of female students, students with special needs and those from emerging regions through orientations
- Improve the quality of guidance and counseling support services for students through training and discussions with instructors

The EQA team could see the information on the points of concern for orientation for students (preventive guidance and counseling strategy) October 2011 which was aimed to enrich preparedness of students to adjust themselves for learning in the University by getting the necessary information ahead of time.

Student Representative System

Students are the major stakeholder/client/customer of the teaching- learning process. The ultimate goal of teaching is to create the desired learning outcomes in students through their active participation in each and every activity of the University. After going through a sample of minutes, the EQA team concludes that student's representatives are involved in the decision making process in the institute council. ECSU has already established a student representative system to address students' concerns. The EQA team has had a discussion with members of the representatives and gained good insight about the overall activity that concerns students. The University disclosed that it seeks to encourage the role of students as partners in the process of enhancement of quality by seeking their views on how best to achieve the University's mission and strategic goals (Internal Quality Assurance Handbook, page 11). They are entitled to be involved and represented in the University's quality management from lower level up to the senate. The Handbook further states that, in arranging student representation at various levels the institute should:

- Provide support and training for those who will act as student representative
- Make clear the roles and responsibilities of student representatives associated with particular form of representation (senate, academic council, etc)
- Make arrangements other than meetings to get students views, for example, through questionnaires or access to consult college or institute officials
- Set mechanisms for selection of student representatives
- Develop induction and guidance materials for student representatives in conjunction with student unions/associations
- Where formal meetings take place, provide participants with advance notice, an agenda and the opportunity to raise matters of concern on such agendas.

This is a positive attempt and the University should exert its maximum effort for implementation.

Center for Gender and Development

Through the various discussions held with the head of CGAD, along with other staff and students, the visit of the office of CGAD and consultation of documents, the EQA team noted that a Center for Gender and Development (CGAD), formerly known as CWIM, has been established to encourage teaching, training, research and advocacy on gender and women in the University. The center supports the promotion of gender equality not only in the University but in the whole country as well. It has established a Center for Gender and Development (CGAD) to enhance the active participation of females in higher education to help manage the current gender disparity. The center is staffed with a head and 3 consultants. CGAD is exerting its effort to support the University in attaining one of its objectives: that of *enhancing the retention of female students*. To accomplish this, CGAD is undertaking the following activities:

- conducting a wide-ranging study to identify the challenges that female students encounter during their stay at the University
- offering training and counseling services to students and staff members of the University on gender related matters
- fostering a gender-friendly environment that will contribute to the success of female students
- increasing the proportion of female graduates
- increasing the proportion of women on the University staff

One of the tools being used to communicate activities of CGAD is an interesting quarterly newsletter entitled "GAD in Focus" (Gender and Development in Focus). The newsletter is designed to inform readers on gender and development efforts and challenges (national and international), and to provide space for the writings of students and academic and nonacademic personnel of the University as well as to report on the various activities of the CGAD. The components of the newsletter include *The Role of ECSU in Narrowing the Gender Gap in Civil Service Sectors; Gender equality: The Swedish Approach to Fairness; Global Gender Facts on Females' Education etc.* Through the various discussions held with the head of CGAD, and other

staff and students, the visit of the office of CGAD and consultation of documents, the EQA team noted that ECSU has been carrying out a preferential choice intervention for female civil servants by which female candidates who obtain the pass mark and above get priority in the selection. This and other activities carried out by ECSU are commendable and appreciated by EQA team.

Dormitories

Ethiopian Civil Service University provides dormitory services at both campuses for all undergraduate and postgraduate students. Students are allocated to the dormitories based on their sex and entry year every semester. The SED (page 25) states that the total holding capacities of the buildings is about 2602 students. The total number of showers and toilets is 278 and 214 respectively. On average, at University level 1 toilet and 1 shower are being used by 10 and 13 students respectively. The sanitation of the corridors and toilets are regularly supervised by janitors / cleaners assigned at each floor. The cleaners and students are responsible for the sanitation of their respective floors and dormitories.. Proctors are assigned to every block to monitor sanitation, security of dormitories and facilitate the maintenance of electric outlets, chairs, lockers and other facilities.

The EQA team visited both female and male dormitories and observed that the cleanliness of the dormitories, corridors and toilets is satisfactory. The capacity of each room ranges from 2-10 students per room. Inside the dormitory, based on their numbers, students have chairs, tables and lockers. The EQA team noted that each block of dormitories has TV facilities. The buildings that comprise female dormitories have some empty rooms used for reading / study. Female students do not need to walk to a library at night. The EQA team noted that all visitors are checked in and checked out by a proctor. Laundry facilities are available to students near their dormitories.

During the visit to the dormitory buildings, the EQA observed that various facilities such as a bed, chair, a table and locker were available to every student. There was sufficient electricity and adequate water supply services. The women's dormitory, too, has all facilities; however, there is poor light in the toilets. The dormitory has a long corridor with very poor lighting.

The EQA team observed that a bridge located in between student's dormitory and cafeteria needs maintenance to improve its safety. It looks unsafe for students to cross. This was also raised by student representatives during the meeting held with the EQA team.

Health Service

There is one clinic in the University that offers health services for regular students. It gives treatment for various health problems of students. The clinic does not provide HIV testing and counseling. A separate HIV management office serves the University community. For serious cases, students may be referred to Menelik Hospital, Zewditu Hospital, or Defense General Hospital. One standby ambulance is available for emergency use. The clinic offers 24 hour service. It has a pharmacy. It is coordinated by a team leader and staffed with four senior nurses, a laboratory technician, a pharmacy technician, a clerk and a cleaner as well as one medical doctor, who, works on a part time basis 3 days per week from 5pm to 7pm. The average number of students who receive health services from the clinic are about 30-40 per day (SED page 25).

The EQA team visited the clinic and spoke with the practitioner in charge. The common infirmities reported in order of frequency are respiratory tract infection and gastritis. According to the health practitioner, most of the students' illnesses are related to poor hygiene, change in weather and dietary problems.

The clinic is located in the basement of the male student dormitory. It is clean and staffed with appropriate professionals and equipped with the necessary medical equipment. It was observed that the location is not appropriate in offering health services as voiced by student representatives who met with the EQA team. As a result, some students seem dissatisfied with the efficiency of services offered in the clinic.

During the visit, it was observed that a new building is under construction and it was reported that some of the rooms will be used for clinic purposes which can address the concerns.

HIV and AIDS Management

The University has established an independent HIV and AIDS management unit. The activities of the unit are very effective. It has an annual plan and a reporting mechanism. For instance, among the HIV and AIDS mainstreaming in BSC activities and results of 2003 EC, most were achieved beyond the plan. This success was achieved with the unprecedented support from partners and stakeholders such as DKT Ethiopia, Federal HIV and AIDS Prevention and Control office. The

concern, enthusiasm and participation of internal stakeholders for training and community conversation have contributed to its' success. The contribution of external stakeholders such as Custom and Revenue Authority also assists.

Table 5.1 The overall view of HIV and AIDS management issues in the BSC plan and performance of 2003 EC

Perspective	Objectives	Measures	Baseline	Annual		Remark
				Target	Achievement	
Public sector	-Facilitate the forum for training and discussion to create awareness -Conduct a research to public sector on operational system, policy and structure	-Number of employers and their managers -Research output	3	140 1	2205 (Male 1142; Female 1063)	The HIV/AIDS Mainstreaming training was offered to the employees of Ethiopian Custom and Revenue Authority Three research proposals have been submitted on 3 different topics to be carried out by 12 professionals selected from different departments
Internal operation	Services of the unit (current information, flyers, peers life skill training; examine and counseling, discussion and events	-Students participated in community discussion -participant students -dispatched messages and publications -condom supply	360	480	200 (Female 113; male 87) 226 (female 89; male 137) 1500 flyers, brochures and posters are distributed to the users -22300 condoms are supplied	-in six rounds -in four rounds
<p>The following are summaries of the major outcomes of the activities of the HIV and AIDS Management Unit.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>The ECSU staff and students benefit from the HIV and AIDS management unit through awareness training, and research activities</i> 						

- *The mainstreaming activities of HIV and AIDS in selected sections of the ECSU community forum is a testimony of its work*
- *HIV/AIDS training is increasing through the coordination of the unit*
- *Beneficiaries of the services of the unit are always increasing*
- *Due to the increasing demand for condoms, the supply and distribution area includes the dormitory and corridor which suits the beneficiaries*
- *The ECSU HIV and AIDS management duty is now integrated with other Federal Civil Service organizations and all higher education institutions through membership of a collaborative forum membership. This encourages sharing of experience and best practice*

On the other hand, the HIV and AIDS Management Unit of ECSU encountered the following challenges.

- *Attitudinal problems observed by some people*
- *Some beneficiaries are not willing to understand the scope, mandate and duty of the HIV and AIDS Management Unit*

- *Some factions are unable to understand the need for a multi-faceted response*
- *Some inhabitants in the University community do not understand their role in prevention*
- *There are many people who consider that the prevention and control of HIV and AIDS activities is the responsibility of one unit, resulting in poor engagement in mainstreaming*

The HIV and AIDS Unit is making the following efforts to cope up with the problems it has encountered.

- *Carrying out continuous efforts and keeping an eye on the results*
- *Establishing a continuous communication scheme physically and through telephone/email to provide its services*
- *Members of the unit meet regularly, discuss and evaluate openly in order to take personal and communal measures*
- *Training of students through peers around dormitories and other places on campus in order to empower students in r their active engagement in HIV and AIDS prevention and control*
- *Discussion with students and collection of feedback showed that awareness creating activities should be carried out on weekends/Saturday and Sunday/ and just before and after exam periods.*

The following are major developments and results expected from the HIV and AIDS Management Unit in the near future.

- *To enhance the quality of change management and resources for the completion of the plan*
- *To strengthen the commitment, motivation and efficiency of staff of the unit so as to maintain their performance results and to play a well-built joint role*
- *To endorse the policy*
- *To strengthen data management, monitoring and evaluation system*
- *The inclusion of HIV and AIDS issues in each and every curriculum as an independent course so that all students of the University can learn about it. This can be facilitated when the curriculum is endorsed by the senate for implementation.*
- *In order to make the HIV and AIDS mainstreaming more effective, important activities will include strengthening and expanding the established community discussion forums, capacity building of the staff of the unit so that it can enhance its role to take full responsibility for awareness, manual skill, technical support, and refreshment to create a conducive environment*
- *To facilitate arrangements for those people who live with HIV and AID in taking medicine*

The EQA team observed that, unlike other HEIs, there is a strong, well-established and effective system found in ECSU regarding HIV and AIDS prevention activities. This is very impressive and a commendable practice.

Recreational Facilities

The SED (page 25) reports that ECSU has 3 volleyball fields, 3 areas for table tennis and other indoor games and Digital Satellite Television (DStv) (one in every block and student's lounges) in two campuses. The EQA team observed volleyball pitches and table tennis. The sports facilities are not sufficient for the large number of students at the University. The EQA team heard from students and the Director of student service that recreational facilities are limited. It was noted that the University has a critical scarcity regarding football, basketball and handball fields which has been somewhat embarrassing to students. It was reported that the absence of a football field had meant that students could not take part in football and athletics competitions.

The space limitation on campus does not allow the institution to possess the kind of recreational facilities a higher education institution should have. The team was told about the future master

plan of the University: it was prepared by IUDS and includes all the facilities stated above. This should be strengthened and speeded up as much as possible.

Cafeteria Services

Ethiopian Civil Service University provides cafeteria services on both campuses for every undergraduate and graduate student although some overcrowding has been noted. The SED (page 26) states that the University cafeteria provides breakfast, lunch and dinner in a very organized manner for more than 3,000 undergraduate and postgraduate students. Special meals are also prepared during religious festivals and national holidays. The daily budget for the provision of food is 8 birr per student.

During the visit of the cafeterias, the EQA team observed no hygiene problems during the process of food preparation, or with the appliances and the cafeteria itself. Cold rooms for meat and vegetables have been installed. The report in the SED (page 26) and the meetings with students confirm that, the capacity is inadequate to cope well with the size of student population. However, during the visit of the facilities, the EQA team noted that at present, there is no major space problem.

Lounges

The EQA team visited student lounges in both campuses. The student lounge on the main campus is located near the student's dormitory and the canteen. Both lounges provide beverages such as soft drinks, tea, coffee and milk. The indoor games, such as Checkers game and Chess are found in the lounges. DStv is available at each student lounge. During the discussion held with student representatives, one of their concerns was the absence of meals/snacks in the students' lounge. The EQA team also shared the concern of students. Staff lounges are also available at both campuses and provide food for staff at a reasonable price.

With regard to Focus Area 5 (Student Admission and Support Services) the EQA team commends the University on the following:

- (i) The establishment of a new Gender Mainstreaming Office to support female staff and students.
- (ii) Well maintained sanitation in the students dormitories.
- (iii) Ongoing construction of the new healthcare facility building.
- (iv) The existence of a well-organized and effective HIV and AIDS Management Unit.
- (v) The establishment of a new Guidance And Counseling Office.

The following are the recommendations of the EQA team on Focus Area 5 (Student Admission and Support Services)

A. Essential recommendations

The EQA team recommends that the University:

- (i) paints all interior walls of the dormitory corridors with white synthetic paint to offer good interior light quality;
- (ii) remodels each panel door of the bedrooms so that small windows with obscure or opaque glass are provided above human chin height to offer additional light into the dark corridors;
- (iii) ensures that students are fully aware of the counseling service; consider increasing resources for a counseling service to meet the educational support needs of students;

B. Advisable recommendations

The EQA team recommends that the University:

- (iv) gives due attention to improving the recreational facilities;
- (v) speeds up the process proposed for the construction of the crossing bridge located between the students dormitory and the cafeteria on the main campus to improve safe access and suitability;

C. Desirable recommendations

The EQA team recommends that the University:

- (vi) ensures that students are adequately supported and that support activities are well coordinated and sustainable.

6: Program Relevance and Curriculum

The EQA team concluded the following based on the SED and discussions held with the Academic Standards and Curriculum Review Standing Committee. In line with The University's Reestablishment Proclamation 12/2006, issued by the Federal Government Capacity Building Strategy and Program (1994), the designing of a new program should be based on the initiation of the University's stake-holders (Federal and Regional States Civil Service Organizations) needs assessment and/ or research.

Once the program is found relevant and accepted by University top management, an ad hoc committee (curriculum development team) comprised different experts, will be established at the department level to prepare a draft curriculum which will be submitted to the department to be reviewed and refined before being sent to the institute for further review by the institute council. The institute council conducts a workshop involving experts on the area within and without the University community including stakeholders (current and former students, representatives of civil service organizations). After incorporating all the comments obtained at the workshop, the council approves the curriculum and endorses it (through the vice president) to the University Curriculum and Standards Committee for further professional comments. Once comments are made and minuted, the Curriculum and Standards Committee sends it back to the Institute Council who incorporates the minted comments and endorses the document to the Senate for the final approval. These committees are clearly of great importance in ensuring that the curricula offered are appropriate and relevant in content and that students are assessed against recognized standards and are in line with the aims and objectives of the curricula that they have followed.

Together, these committees should provide good assurance of the curricula of all programs. One of the tasks of the EQA team was to seek information on whether all course catalogues have included all the objectives of all courses so that students are able to prepare themselves for the final assessments. The EQA team was provided with documents from several institutes: - Institute of Public Management and Development Studies, Institute of Legal Studies, Institute of Federalism and Institute of Urban Studies. All institutes have included course objectives in their catalogues. The EQA team also reviewed a document entitled "Ethiopian Civil Service University, Academic Programs Office, and Standard for Curriculum Approval" which serves as a guideline for all institutes. The course catalogues set out the aims and objectives of the programs and the courses that make up each program. Short descriptions of each course in the former documents are set according to this general guideline. This document is a general guideline for all faculties on how to prepare their course catalogues, describe the objectives of each course, including the expected learning outcomes of programs and content and objectives.

At its meeting with the members of the ASCRC, the EQA team was told that at present, there is no problem of communicating the objectives of the courses to students in all faculties as students were given orientations at various levels. Students attended a general orientation at the beginning of the academic year by the University Registrar, then at the department level. Students were provided course catalogues, information on the University Web-site and more by the classroom teacher at the beginning of the course. Instructors also know this very well as they are evaluated by the students on whether they communicate the objective of their courses at the start. The team also tried to check directly with students themselves in its meeting with student representatives. Students also confirmed the above claims. In addition, some senior students were of the view that some years back it was not in place.

On the other hand, the relationship between the Department Curriculum Committees and the Senate Academic Standards and Curriculum Review Committee appears to be loose. There is no clear indication of involvement of the ASCRC at Department and Faculty levels. In addition, there is no monitoring or evaluation committee established at the University's' administrative level to assess the existing curricula using standard criteria.

The minutes provided to the EQA team were mostly focused on postgraduate programs, not undergraduate programs. This was of great concern to the EQA team. Other documents obtained were:

- documents on Curriculum Review conducted in 2011 by the Development Economics Department Workshop,
- Course Syllabus Revision of Development Economics Master's Program undertaken

on Oct 30, 2010.

- minutes from the Institute of Federalism and Legal Studies (August 4, 2009),
- the LLM Curriculum Review,
- A letter from the Institute of Tax and Custom Administration AVP's Office, (subject: Sending the Revised Final Version of the MA Curriculum for Public Procurement and Asset Management) and
- Minutes of the Senate on curriculum approval for advanced Standing in Urban Engineering (Dec. 12, 2007).

Current efforts on the curriculum are being directed to documenting courses in standard format, sequencing courses to create programs and creating a course catalogue. Unfortunately, the EQA team was not provided with minutes of any department curriculum committee meetings or records of workshops at which curricula were discussed, thus EQA was unable to comment on the process.

Another aspect of the curriculum that came to light in meetings with staff relates to credit hours and students loadings. While the University requires that each course be given a credit hour rating and there are guidelines as to the minimum and maximum credit hours of courses that a student may take, the concept of student loading appears to be unknown. Courses are given credit hours based on the amount of contact time. In this system lecture hours are given more credit than projects or workshops. In addition, time to complete assignments, study, prepare for and do examinations is not considered. With no common expectation of the overall workload for a typical student, different courses of the same credit rating can make vastly different demands on students. The University has not set an expectation of the nominal weekly workload of a typical student other than the hours of class attendance. This makes it difficult to develop curricula. It also means that students can easily be overworked or alternatively, can be under-occupied. The University is trying to address this issue through a modularization curriculum.

It is hoped that the Academic Standards and Curriculum Review Committee of the Senate will take action on these matters.

With regard to Focus Area 6 (Program Relevance and Curriculum) the EQA team commends the University on the following:

- (i) The establishment of the Academic Standards and Curriculum Review Committee of Senate.
- (ii) The participation of different bodies both from inside and outside the University in approving a program through workshops and seminars.
- (iii) The existence of a general Guideline Document which all institutes have followed in preparing their respective subject area courses and programs.
- (iv) The efforts to create a course catalogue in a standard format.
- (v) The provision of guidelines by the academic institutes to all departments to create a course catalogue.
- (vi) Involving different committees at different levels forming a chain of responsibility for course and program approval.
- (vii) Intensive internship attachment with different organizations.

The following are the recommendations of the EQA team on Focus Area 6 (Program Relevance and Curriculum)

A. Essential recommendations

The EQA team recommends that the University:

- (i) continues periodic reviews of the curricula;

B. Advisable recommendations

The EQA team recommends that the University:

- (ii) makes the curriculum more activity oriented;
- (iii) makes clear the course objectives, descriptions and contents for every course and reference materials;

C. Desirable recommendations

The EQA team recommends that the University:

- (iv) avails written documents to further fulfill the current needs of employers of its graduates for further development.

7: Teaching, Learning and Assessment

Every HEI must employ appropriate teaching, learning and assessment methods to ensure effective implementation of its programs. In order to get a full understanding of the teaching, learning and assessment, the EQA team analyzed various documents, held discussions with students, staff and heads and observed teaching. The findings on the issues are stated as follows.

Teaching and Learning

The various discussions with staff identified that the University formerly used lectures as the primary teaching method, suggesting the lecture could have been interactive. As stated in the SED (page 30), presently, the teaching and learning process of the University is steered by the Education Policy and Guidelines of the University which was developed as a result of the BPR study that the University conducted. According to the Education Policy and Guidelines of the University, ECSU employs learner-centered teaching approaches to address multiple intelligence and learning differences. The University is doing this with the belief that ensuring the quality of teaching and learning requires applying teaching methods that maximize the learning strategy of students to manifest their potential in solving real world problems. The observation of teaching carried out by the EQA team showed a mixed picture in some classrooms where learner centered approaches are practiced, whereas, in other sections, a traditional lecture method dominates. Although, variations in the types of courses make a difference, more efforts are required to further engage students.

The SED (page 31) states that although there is a good start and trend of applying learner-centered teaching methods across the institutes of the University, there are still some problems in its application. It was discovered that, in many course syllabi, there is still a tendency to use lecture and discussion methods more than other teaching strategies. Implementers of the teaching learning process in ECSU believe that applying learner-centered approaches, require time and continuous planning in order to monitor the process, to orient and support instructors in its application to move away from traditional practices. It can be said that the challenge may also rest on the students' lack of interest and preparation for class participation. The number of students in the classroom may be large and the content of the course may need more time to cover the material required. Some teachers may prefer to use the traditional method. Whatever types of challenges occur, the EQA team advises the University to strengthen and stick to the student-centered teaching and learning process. Students can only achieve the required learning outcomes if, and only if, they actively participate in the process.

The EQA team found that the University utilizes a range of teaching methods. These vary from department to department. In the department of urban planning; most of the courses are project-based, with lecture, handout, group discussion, PowerPoint, hands on exercises, case study, video-conferencing, mini- projects in urban hydrology, use of software etc.

Academic Advice

The SED (page 39) states that a minimum of three hours consultation is required from each instructor of the University. The consultation schedule is also included in the syllabi of each course and discussion is undertaken with students in the first contact of the class. Instructors are also required to post their consultation schedule on their office door. In many cases, the academic staff office is appropriate for offering academic advice, however, in some departments, 3-6 permanent academic staff members share a room. Instructors need to convince their students about the importance for their continuous development by going beyond and notifying instructors for periodic consultation to be better prepared in their courses. (SED page 32).

Department heads are responsible for checking and monitoring whether instructors consult their students in accordance with the schedule. Some institutes assign each academic advisor to a group of 10-20 freshman undergraduate students to assist on specific course related matters and on all academic related matters. In some cases, a teacher is assigned to a section to advise and consult students. The EQA team noted the existence of such activities in some institutes, however, it should be strengthened and a well established system required in monitoring its implementation. Best practices of the academic consultation trends observed in some institutes should be shared with other institutes..

The challenges regarding academic advice include

- Lack of information about the significance of academic consultation
- Lack of awareness about how students can benefit from academic consultation
- Lack of interest and commitment from students about contacting their instructors for such help
- The need for continuous invitation and reminding of students to come for consultation
- The task needs continuous follow- up and effort to make it fruitful and sustainable
- The need for exerting maximum efforts to establish the impact of the activities performed so far regarding academic consultation

Tutorial Support

The University has a well established system to offer tutorial support to students. The CAPD handles all matters pertaining to this task. Two types of tutorial support are offered to students. The first one is given to those students who want and need the support, while the second is given to female students and those students who come from emerging regions (Afar, Benishangul, Gambella and Somali). The EQA team accessed documentation and communication letters exchanged between the Institutes and the CAPD regarding the training needs assessment for students who want this support. The center conducted meetings with students and identified their training needs. The types of skill training vary from institute to institute. The various institutes send a list of students who want support from CAPD. Female students and visually impaired students need the training the most. They need extra inputs in those subjects which help them to enhance their learning process. The analysis of documents and discussion with students showed that the majority of students need additional support in the following areas.

- Computer training on the operation of keyboard, windows, word and internet with the necessary software for the visually impaired
- English Language Skill development (Spoken and Written; Paper writings, Research writings)
- Numerical skill
- Research Method and Techniques

Master's degree students enjoy the training and aggressively move about to benefit from the training. The EQA team noted that this enthusiasm and practice should be a part of the spirit of undergraduate students.

The SED (page 31) states that in order to maintain the balance between theories and practice, all postgraduate level courses and most undergraduate level courses should include practical assignments in the form of term papers. The curriculum of the programs and the course syllabus of courses offered show that senior essays and Masters Thesesxx in undergraduate and the postgraduate programs respectively enable students to link what they have studied theoretically with the actual work life. Depending upon the type of courses, teachers give individual and group assignments, projects, student presentations, and reflection on the effective teaching and learning process.

On average, the staff workload ranges from 7 to 18 credit hours a week for local academic staff and can be 23 or more for foreigners. This varies according to the nature of the courses. While all the courses need developing practice or skill, sometimes in the teaching learning process, the ratio of theory vs. practice varies from course to course.

The evaluation of teaching and learning approaches is carried out in different ways. The academic staff are evaluated by the Department head (35%), peer and team leader (15%) and students (50%). The format used for instructor's performance evaluation by students comprises five parts: planning (15%) delivery (50%), assessment (15%), time management (10%), and professional ethics (10%). The EQA team noted that these are understandably important.

Accordingly, the instructor is expected: to prepare a well organized course syllabus (session detail, course description, objectives, contents, time, mode of delivery, assessment modality,

reference); to communicate the objectives, contents and teaching methodology in the syllabus to students on the first day of the class. The instructor is encouraged to make topics and activities meaningful and relevant to students; to encourage students to speak up and actively participate in the class apply continuous assessment methods to evaluate students' performance. Students should be punctual in arriving on time and leave class on time. Class time is for relevant academic activities only and consults for students to be scheduled in advance for a consultation with the instructor. The EQA team substantiated the significance of well-stated performance measuring tools towards achieving the aspired results and success.

The department heads have the responsibility to establish course groups which consist of the instructors who teach similar courses. They have the responsibility to make the project standardized, revising the mode of delivery, active learning and oversee the mode of assessment. There is a frequent panel discussion. Face to face evaluation in front of students is also one of the practices in the University. All these have their contributions.

There is a well-established system to control whether students and instructors are participating in the teaching- learning process properly or not. The SED (page 34) states that each instructor is required to take attendance of each contact hour in the semester to monitor the attendance and take appropriate measures. It further makes clear that to strengthen this practice and make it sustainable, it is important to create a system in all institutes of the University to present a monthly student attendance report from each instructor to the respective department and to take early measures to overcome problems and prevent student dropout.

During the discussion with students, academic staff and department heads consider the information obtained from the SED pertaining to the evaluation of teaching and learning approaches. The EQA team identified the following challenges:

- In a few cases, in those institutes that use more part time teachers, some part time teachers do not attend classes / miss classes repeatedly and do not redress as it should be / as regularly as the permanent staff
- In a few cases some teachers come late
- In very few cases there is a trend of not starting classes on the first day of the first week of the semester
- Lack of well organized documentation of the number of classes missed or the amount of time/hours missed due to late coming and the consequent action of whether those missed classes or hours are properly compensated during make up classes or not

All in all, there is a well established system of evaluating the overall activities that are being carried out in the University. In a biweekly meeting of the departments, the teaching-learning process and its problems are discussed. Instructors share their approaches, best practices and the problems encountered in the teaching -learning process.

The EQA team found that the Education Policy and Guidelines of the University has addressed assessment policy issues. It gives a direction about the principle and procedures that should be followed in assessing students learning. ECSU employs continuous assessment, which involves varieties of assessment tools to address learner differences. It was found that for effective and fruitful implementation of assessment policy, CPAD offers trainings on Learning Assessment, Marking and Grading, Continuous Assessment, and Student Assessment at various times.

To make the assessment and grading policy known to the students and staff of the University, the Education Policy and Guideline is distributed to all institutes and departments and thereby to respective instructors and students. It is made available on the ECSU website. The departments disseminate this assessment and grading policy through the different forums of discussion with instructors and students and during the review of their respective courses and preparing the course syllabus.

The EQA team found that teachers began to implement the assessment policy through the course assessment plan that is indicated in the course syllabus. The SED (page 35) states that almost all teachers give, with some difference, three to four continuous assessments that cover 60%-70% and a final exam that covers 30-40%. It further describes that the continuous assessment used in ECSU includes:

- Paper and pencil tests

- Group and /or individual work
- Assignments
- Project works
- Student presentation
- Case analysis

Everybody knows the importance of continuous assessment to provide immediate feedback on the teaching and learning and to create opportunities to improve it accordingly. It enables the teachers to decide how well his/her instruction is going and how students are progressing. The EQA team wants to emphasize that students benefit significantly if the continuous assessment is implemented properly. It was noted that there have been challenges in implementing continuous assessment as it is considered as a burden and pressure. This might be due to lack of well organized planning and scheduling/programming.

Testing Committees help to facilitate the implementation of the policy. Instructors and students are held responsible for its proper implementation. The process is that instructors submit a course plan at the beginning of each year/semester. The plan is used to check the implementation of continuous assessment. Student course evaluation / course syllabus assessment methods are stated in the course plan and course outline. Post course evaluation is used at the end of each semester.

The EQA team accessed the committee minutes providing details on the standard of continuous assessments to be maintained by instructors giving courses in the Public Financial Management Department. The main content of the minute deals with the establishment of a continuous assessment quality assurance committee, which is following up the standards of continuous assessment and/or exams by the instructors according to the standards set by the Department Council indicated below:

- For tests:
 - > The number of tests should be 2 to 3 in a semester
 - > Component of tests: minimum of two; that is one objective and subjective/ essay type. The subjective essay type component is mandatory in any test.
- Other modes of assessment such as quizzes, term papers, and individual and/or group assignments are required
- The weight for internal assessments (tests and other modes) is a minimum of 60%
- Final exam:
 - > Weight maximum of 40%
 - > The components of the final exam should depend on the nature of courses. Here, the subjective/essay type/workout part is mandatory and must be completed before the final the exam

Evaluation in each course should take place at least four times per semester based on the information stated above (tests, other assessments, final exam). The assessments must be in accordance with the assessments detailed in the course syllabus of the course the instructor is offering.

The EQA team also considered a Format for continuous assessments for PFM Department; a Grade Report Format; and the Student Mark list. The continuous assessment sample records show that slight variations occur across departments in the number of tests and allocated marks for the test. The Common pattern is Test 1, Test 2, Test 3, Test 4, Participation, Group assignment, Individual assignment, Assignment, Mid and Final exam. In all, an average of 4-6 assessments are being given although there are differences across the programs. The EQA team assessed this as good experience.

There is a section in the Education Policy and Guidelines about the specific procedures in exam administration, including marking, grading and communicating results. The SED (page 37) states

that, a single instructor marks exam papers and there is no anonymous or dual marking to check instructors' marking accuracy. The EQA team found that this is just a traditional method so a better form of applying marking is required to meet the standards. The University has already developed a grading system in which a number of departments have been applying the criteria referenced assessment approach that entails the implementation of a fixed grading system. This should be further strengthened.

Most instructors tell their students about their assessment results gradually and plainly. However, there are some teachers who did not allow students to see their final exam scripts and results. The SED (page 37) states that *"some postgraduate students interviewed stated their dissatisfaction on the adequacy and helpfulness of the script comments given by their teachers on open ended/subjective/ exam questions and assignments to learn from their mistakes and identify their strengths and weaknesses. This problem is also observed in the sample marked exams and assignment work"*.

The University has a fixed scale grading system which is being implemented to assess student achievements fairly and to assure standards are maintained from year to year and to grade sections of students consistently. The EQA team advises ECSU to match the fixed scale grade (a certain letter and the value or grade point each represents) with the objectives of the course and the expected learning outcomes to be achieved by students.

The assessment policy and procedures are communicated to the University community through the staff handbook and the students' handbook. Among the roles and responsibilities of staff, the list of activities related to assessment is outlined. The Education Policy and

Guidelines which sets out arrangements for assessment and other issues are available on the ECSU website.

Regarding the student appeal system, the procedures on how student grievances are handled and rectified (if necessary) are described in the Education Policy and Guidelines. The SED (page 37) stated that the procedure is not practiced exactly as stipulated in the policy and there is no assigned body to investigate such cases at University or institute level. However, students are always allowed to contact the institute and their respective departments whenever they have complaints and grievances on assessment results. Students can discuss assessments with their instructors and if they are still not satisfied, they can present the case to the director of the institute council where there are representatives of students as members. The EQA team urges ECSU to ensure implementation of the appeal procedures exactly as stated in the policy. In addition, the University is working towards maximizing student satisfaction in other aspects of campus life through direct discussion with them or through their representatives, through administrative support services, department head, adjudication with their instructors, communication and above all, the instructors' themselves ask students whether they have any problems.

With regard to Focus area 7 (Teaching, Learning and Assessment) the EQA team commends the University on the following:

- (i) The attempt to employ learner-centered teaching approaches to address multiple intelligence and learning differences.
- (ii) The existence of well established systems such as: a biweekly meeting of the departments for evaluating the teaching-learning process and its problems through discussion.
- (iii) The use of a range of teaching methods which vary from department to department.
- (iv) The well established system to offer tutorial support to students.
- (v) The format used by students to evaluate the performance of their instructors.
- (vi) The existence of a written assessment policy and its communication to the University community.
- (vii) The system to check the implementation of continuous assessment.
- (viii) The existence of Formats for continuous assessments at various Departments.

The following are the recommendations of the EQA team on Focus Area 7 (Teaching, Learning, and Assessment):

A. Essential recommendations

The EQA team recommends that the University:

- (i) monitors the implementation of learner-centered teaching approaches;
- (ii) encourages students further to benefit from tutorial services;
- (iii) ensures that the staff provide adequate academic advice and support to students;

B. Advisable recommendations

The EQA team recommends that the University:

- (iv) makes female students work hard to develop self confidence;
- (v) strengthen the established system for the full scale implementation of continuous assessment;
- (vi) introduces anonymous marking and double marking where practicable;

C. Desirable recommendations

The EQA team recommends that the University:

- (vii) examines the implementation of the Education Policy and Guidelines on teaching and learning and assessment and takes action as necessary;
- (viii) introduces a system to use external examiners for undergraduate students to help moderate standards and report on the quality and relevance of programs where practicable.

8: Student Progression and Graduate Outcomes Student

Progression

With regard to student progression and graduate outcomes, the SED lacked systematically organized data on the admission and progression of student cohorts and did not include accurate data from the Registrar's office. During the audit visit, the EQA team observed that the office of the Registrar was automated in such a way that student information could be readily available and easily accessible from one database.

The SED (page 38) acknowledges that neither the institutes nor the Admission and Registrar Office have systematically organized data that clearly show students' attrition rates. It took time and effort of the internal quality audit team to organize and analyze the data provided by the Admission and Registrar Office. Moreover, the data lacks precision in stating the number of dropout students. Sometimes the number of students stated to be dropped out, withdrawn or dismissed is not subtracted from the number of students in the next year. Therefore, the number of students recorded as attrition by the Admission and Registrar Office seems to be incorrect. It is lower than the stated figures.

From discussion with staff members and information gathered from the Registrar office the EQA team noted that the overall attrition rate of the University is low. The data organized by the internal quality audit team also shows that the University wide attrition rate is generally low in terms of both absolute numbers and percentages. The data on the attrition rate is not uniform. It varies across institutes, program levels, academic years and sexes. The attrition rate for graduate students is low as compared to the attrition rate of undergraduate students in all institutes.

The SED tries to analyze the attrition rates of different institutes based on the existing data of the Registrar. In ITCA, the attrition rate of undergraduate students was 0.97% in 2011 that is 0.9% for male students whereas 1% for female students. In the same institute and program level the attrition rate was 2.5 % in 2009/10 with 2.3% for male and 3.6% for female students. On the other hand, the attrition rate was 0% in 2008/9 academic year. In IPMDS, in 2008/9 undergraduate student's attrition was 9.4% which was 4.8% for males and 28.9% for female students. The above attrition rate decreased to 1.1% in 2009/10 and 2.5% in 2010/11. Attrition rate in IUDS ranges from 4.5% (Urban Engineering) in 2008/9 to 0% in 2010/11 (Urban Planning). The attrition rate of Urban Planning students seems relatively low as compared with Urban Engineering students. The aggregate data in two consecutive years indicates that the attrition rate at University level was 3.8% in 2008/9 and 2.2% in 2009/10. This implies that there is a trend of declining attrition rates at University level (SED page 3839).

Although the office of the Registrar provided the EQA team with student statistical data, this was not helpful in calculating the rate of attrition as it lacked continuity with regard to data for a cohort of students from admission to graduation that could be used to calculate the rate of attrition. The

EQA team also observed that data was not collected on a routine basis so that it was difficult for the numbers of students progressing from initial registration to graduation on each program to be tracked semester by semester and year by year.

Table 8.1 Admission and total active regular undergraduate students for the year 2011/12, Semester I.

Department	Admission		Dismissal		Dropout		withdrewal		Total		Rate %		Readmission		Total active students (1 st S.2004 EC)	
	F	BS	F	BS	F	BS	F	BS	F	BS	F	BS	F	BS	F	BS
IPMDS	36	287	0	0	1	22	0	0	1	22	2.8	7.7	4	8	35	265
IUDS	80	619	2	2	-5	26	2	2	-1	33	0	5.3	4	9	81	589
ITCA	117	421	0	0	4	22	3	3	7	26	6	6.2	4	9	110	395
Total	233	1327	2	2	0	70	5	5	7	81	3	6.1	12	26	226	1249

Source: SED

Note: BS = both sex (M+F)

From the above table we can see that the student progression from the time of admission (the year of admission is not known) until the first semester of the year 2004 EC indicates that the rate of 'attrition' was very low and that the number of dismissals is lower than that of dropout and withdrawals.

The SED (page 39) also states that, generally, the University wide attrition rates due to dropout and withdrawals are higher than the rates for dismissals. Attrition rates due to dismissal are minimal. On the other hand, the attrition rate of students who came from the better capacity regions of the country (other than the emerging regions) tends to be lower in percentage terms than the rate for students who come from the emerging regions of the countries (Somalia, Benshangul-Gumuz, Gambella and Afar) but greater in absolute numbers. It is also observed that the first year is critical for academic survival especially for undergraduate students. This indicates where the University student support should be concentrated. The data trend shows that the student attrition rate is generally decreasing although this is not consistent. Therefore, it is important to extend the student academic support of the University to enhance students academic performance.

The above data does not tell us the reason why students withdrew or dropped out. No additional explanation is available about the internal and external factors which forced them to leave. This information is very important to inform actions which may minimize attrition. Without having this information, it is difficult to plan measures to solve the problems. The EQA team could not find documented evidence on the root causes of student dropout.

However, the Registrar Office staff suggested several plausible explanations from anecdotal information and word-of-mouth reporting. Among the main determinants for attrition are family problems, health problems and personal conflicts. It was reported to the team that academic deficiencies only account for 3.8% of attrition numbers. Those reasons for attrition are also recognized by staff and were acknowledged in a discussion with senior staff, dean and department heads. During a discourse the staff members also mentioned the proactive measures taken by the University to counteract attrition and to help students stay offering guidance and counseling to needy students.

During discussion the EQA team was told that, despite the above stated problems, minimizing student attrition is one of the major focus areas of the University. The University aspires to achieve zero attrition rates in the long run. The University five year BSC strategic plan 2003-2007 EC (page 17-18) indicates the University plan to achieve student completion rates of 99% and 100% for undergraduate and postgraduate students respectively by providing special attention to females, students from emerging regions and students with special needs (people with disabilities, HIV positive). For this purpose, the University designates one objective among the thirteen strategic objectives formulated in its BSC document. This objective is as follows, "Enhance retention of female students, students from emerging regions and people with special needs". During discussion the EQA team was also told that this objective is cascaded to each institute and

thereby to each department and each instructor. Therefore, the performance of each institute and department will be measured based on their achievements in this regard. To support this objective various support mechanisms are being put in place such as tutorial programs, the expansion of library and additional IT services.

Graduate outcomes

Regarding the University's graduate employment destinations, the EQA team noted that all of the students of the University are employees of government organizations and are sponsored by their respective employers, the graduates return to their respective regions and organizations. Therefore, ECSU graduates normally do not face the problem of unemployment.

During discussion the EQA team was told that the University had conducted impact assessment to assess the competency and performance of its graduates in 2000/01 and 2008. A published document was presented as evidence; the EQA team was able to look at the full technical report of the study. Based on the recent (2008) impact assessment report the SED (page 40) states the education provided by ECSU enabled the graduates to become competent in conceptual, technical and ethical knowledge, which is required in the contemporary work environment of the civil service. Thus, the findings indicated that graduates of the University have occupied public offices, both at federal and regional levels, and contributed well, effectively performing the duties and responsibilities as expected of them.

The EQA team noted that ECSU does not have either an informal or formal association of graduates and current students lack the strong emotional bond with their predecessors that such an association provides. The EQA team was told by academic staff members that there is a plan to establish student alumni at the University level in the near future.

With regard to Focus Area 8 (Student Progression and Graduate Outcomes) the EQA team commends the University on the following:

- (i) The deployment of an automated database system for students records.
- (ii) The graduate tracer study/impact assessment conducted by the University.

The following are the recommendations of the EQA team on Focus Area 8 (Student Progression and Graduate Outcomes)

A. Essential recommendations

The EQA team recommends that the University:

- (i) collects, analyses and makes available systematically gathered and organized data on admission, readmission, withdrawal, dropout and dismissal of students for each program and for each cohort of students in each semester and year;
- (ii) systematically investigate and record the root causes of attrition;

B. Advisable recommendations

The EQA team recommends that the University:

- (iii) updates previous student records in the new database system of the registrar;
- (iv) continues to seek other measures to retain students and minimize attrition;

C. Desirable recommendations

The EQA team recommends that the University:

- (v) develops and establishes effective and active alumni links;
- (vi) strengthens the existing trend of tutorial support to reduce the level of attrition due to academic reasons.

9: Research and Outreach Activities

One of the mission statements of the University concerns research. It states that the University has a mission to build capacity in the public sector by facilitating and promoting the ongoing efforts that are targeted at solving problems and building capacities of the civil service. The end goal is to

develop its reputation as a successful research institution. The University is making every endeavor *to address societal needs and promote holistic and sustainable development in the country*. It was with this mission statement in mind that the EQA team considered the current research activity of the University.

The SED identifies research as one of the University's mandates. The SED further states that the University conducts research in various areas focusing mainly on the civil service sector problems in areas, such as urban sector, development and management areas, accounting and finance, federalism and legal matters, and other cross cutting issues, like HIV and AIDS. There is a research and consultancy coordination office which is accountable to the Vice president of academic development. The office has set its own Research Policy & Guidelines. The EQA team received this document entitled "Research Policy & Guidelines (May, 2009, Addis Ababa)". The existence of the document indicates that the University has a clearly stated policy which is also communicated to its community as the information obtained in the group discussions with the concerned bodies revealed.

According to this research policy and guidelines document, each member of staff has the responsibility to fulfill the conditions stipulated in the policy guidelines to be involved in research. That is, - to remain abreast of current research and research methods, to be up-to-date with new developments, to collaborate with other researchers, and to maintain a research culture in their respective academic fields among others. The policy also details the incentives provided to motivate staff to participate in research. However, staff participation in research depends on the following three criteria: - the quality of the proposed project, its activities, and the cost of the proposed project. It is also stipulated in the Senate Legislation of the ECSU (November 2010) that each member of staff in any department is expected to spend 25% of his/her time on research. However, it was not possible to get exact information as to what percentage of the academic staff is engaged in research. The SED also does not mention this. Therefore, it does not appear that all staff members in all departments engage in research work as is expected of them. In the discussion with the Quality Assurance (QA) committee of the University, the members of the QA committee confirmed this. They explained that the problem is caused by lack of confidence on the part of some staff members in undertaking research activities and that there is a plan to involve all staff members from all departments in a rigorous training in the future so that they develop the necessary confidence. When asked if there is a problem with funding the QA committee of ECSU assured the EQA team that there is no shortage of funds to support any members of staff who wanted to undertake research.

The University has a vice president with responsibility for academic affairs and research as mentioned earlier. The University has established a Research and Publications Office. The Research and Publications Office is currently led by a chairperson assisted by faculty deans forming a research and publications committee. The EQA team discovered that until now, ECSU has organized five national research conferences. Nevertheless, the Team had access to 2 Journals of ECSU in which the proceedings were published. The first one is the Journal of African Development Studies (JADS), an annual journal where the first issue appeared in December 2010. The second one is the Ethiopian Journal of Public Management and Development an annual journal, the first issue of which appeared in July 2010.

The research findings of the academic staff of ECSU and students were disseminated through local and international journals, ECSU's website, conference presentations, annual symposia and policy briefs as stated in the SED and later proved in interviews with the committee members of the RPCO of ECSU. The SED however does not mention what percentage of the research undertaken was published in local and international journals.

The research activities of ECSU were seen as more than adequate by the SED writing team. The same view was shared by the staff and committee members of the RPCO as revealed in their discussions with EQA team. The groups mentioned that there was no shortage of funding and the academic and professional staff members were getting more motivated and more engaged in research than ever. If there are problems, they are minor ones; such as delay with the reviews as the incentives are low, and some junior staff may lack confidence and these are being taken into considerations.

Thus, there is a tradition to build on and improve the infrastructure that can facilitate development. Furthermore, one of the standing committees of the Senate is The Research and Publications Committee which, according to the *Research, Publication and Consultancy Policy*, has the remit to:

- 1) Oversee research activities: whether funded by the government, the University or regional states
- 2) Execute funding and monitoring of research activities approved by the Senate Research and Publication Committee
- 3) Coordinate research activities all over the University
- 4) Organize seminars, symposia and the like
- 5) Monitor proper implementation of research projects
- 6) Evaluate research outputs of the University
- 7) Approve and direct research to avoid duplication
- 8) Communicate with funding organizations
- 9) Facilitate the production of Journals, proceeding and other scholarly publications by the faculties
- 10) Provide consultancy services concerning research
- 11) Plans for research activities and publication
- 12) Keep records of research activities and publications
- 13) Prepare and compile quarterly, semi-annual and annual research reports
- 14) Issue local ethical clearance for research involving human subjects.

With regard to outreach, the University seeks to provide diversified educational opportunities, consultancy, short-term training and other community services. The SED states that the University established a center to coordinate consultancy service along with short-term training. The consultancy service is mainly on Civil Service Reform, Urban Development and other cross-cutting issues. In relation to Civil Service Reform, the SED and the information obtained from the respective institutes (IUDS) show that the University has been providing consultancy services in the area of BPR and BSC to various government institutions, ranging from Federal Ministries to individual HEIs by assigning 30 academic staff of the University for about four consecutive years. As stated in the SED and as learned from all concerned bodies, ECSU also provides consultancy services pertinent to its students' field of specialization in addition to consultancy services coordinated at the University level. A case in point is the ten year structural and development plans being prepared for different regions by IUDS in different regions of the country.

As the EQA team learned from all concerned bodies in the group discussions, these programs are believed to be very effective as they are the means through which what is learned in theory is interpreted into practice, besides making graduates know in advance what type of services they would be providing after graduation. When asked what problems are encountered when carrying out such programs, the group had a similar view concerning the consultancy service. The program is seen as one of the core businesses of ECSU in rendering service to the community. What has so far been done on the civil service reform and urban development to support the required change is of paramount importance since not only does it benefit society at large but also provides big internal revenues for the University. In the discussion held with Center of Training and Consultancy, the EQA team learned that about 3,000,000 birr revenue could be obtained from providing consultancy and training service every year.

Regarding national and international links, ECSU is in a good position. The SED identifies links with national and international networks and making use of them to strengthen the University. As learned during joint meetings of the ECSU staff and from what is listed in the ECSU pamphlet and SED, the international links are: Banaras Hindu University, Varanasi India; LBSANAA, Moussoorie, India; Kehl University, Germany; Kangwan National University, South Korea; UK National School Government; The French National School Administration; The African Management Development Institutions Network etc.

The University has a well established external relations office and is actively working with all these Universities and is happy about the benefits it gets from such links as revealed in the discussions.

Some of the areas of collaboration with these international institutes as explained in the SED are the exchange of faculty members and researchers, the exchange of students, the exchange of academic information, joint research, and development of materials and the like.

With regard to Focus Area 9 (Research and Outreach Activities) the EQA team commends the University on the following:

- (i) The establishment of a Research and Publications Office.
- (ii) The creation of arrangements for disseminating the research findings of ECSU staff and students the existence of a plan for further improvement .
- (iii) Having Research and Consultancy Policy & Guidelines to increase the budget of the Research and Publications Office, to raise the quantity and quality of research and to give training to the staff to achieve the goal.
- (iv) The practice of publishing two types of journals based on annual conferences on research and publications.
- (v) The practice of designing systems and methods to external links to solicit research funds and grants for HIV and AIDS, etc.
- (vi) The establishment of links with different towns in different regions which not only renders service to the community but also prepares students to meet future work challenges.
- (vii) The establishment of links with many Universities outside Ethiopia.
- (viii) The provision of consultancy services to different regions and ministries.

The following are the recommendations of the EQA team on Focus Area 9 (Research and Outreach Activities)

A. Essential recommendations

The EQA team recommends that the University:

- (i) develops a means to involve all members of staff in research activities by tackling present obstacles;
- (ii) strengthen the Research and Publications Office;
- (iii) encourages a stronger research culture;
- (iv) develops its consultancy capability further;
- (v) extends community service practiced by some institutes such as IUD and include all institutes;
- (vi) motivates teaching staff and students in research activities;

B. Advisable recommendations

The EQA team recommends that the University:

- (vii) provides research training to all department staff;
- (viii) (viii)requires each faculty and department to have a research strategy and a research plan;
- (ix) encourages all members of staff to provide consultancy services;
- (x) researches and documents all its outreach activities;

C. Desirable recommendations

The EQA team recommends that the University:

- (xi) considers the need for all academic staff have contracts stipulating 25% of their time is for research to achieve the requirements in the ECSU's Senate Legislation;
- (xii) ensures that what is in the strategic plan regarding research and consultancy service is delivered according to the plan;
- (xiii) creates a data base which illustrates the number about the research and consultancy output.

10: Internal Quality Assurance

Internal Quality Assurance is a planned and systematic monitoring and review process established by an HEI to determine the quality and relevance of its programs and the appropriateness of its infrastructure. A robust and transparent quality assurance system conveys confidence in the quality of the provision of an HEI to its staff, to students, to employers and to

other stakeholders. HEIs should have a policy and associated procedures for the assurance of the quality and relevance of their programs.

ECSU guides its activities with well-stated policy documents in every area of its activities. Quality assurance is one of these components. The SED (page 45) states that quality assurance is one of the nine major policy issues for ECSU which are covered in the Education Policy Guidelines. For quality assurance, the guidelines list the following five explicit policy issues:

- *University institutes should have formal mechanisms for the approval, periodic review and monitoring of their programs and awards*
- *Quality assurance activities should be based on explicitly published criteria that are applied consistently across programs and Institutes*
- *Quality assurance processes which contain recommendations for action should have a predetermined follow-up procedure for implementation*
- *To maintain quality, the University employs semester course reviews and annual program curriculum reviews, which are led by department heads and Institute Directors*
- *Teaching practice will be evaluated continuously to ensure areas for further improvement be identified*

These are the basic constituents pertaining to Quality assurance.

HEIs should also commit themselves explicitly to the development of a culture which recognizes the importance of relevance, quality and quality assurance in all their activities. They should develop and implement a strategy for the continuous enhancement of quality. The ultimate goal of internal quality assurance is to have a culture of quality care which ensures that quality is a focus of all the activities of an institution at all levels and is incorporated into the everyday work of the whole institutional community. Every HEI must have an internal quality assurance system that seeks to continuously improve the quality of its provision.

ECSU has a well-established quality assurance system with appropriate procedures and mechanisms. It has a separate QA office with three staff, one of whom is a Quality Assurance Team leader: the other two are quality assurance experts. The EQA team was told that the office was established two years ago. The roles and responsibilities of the QA officers are clearly stated and communicated. The Education Quality Assurance Team is accountable to the office of Institutional Planning and Assessment (IPA). The team has developed an internal quality assurance audit handbook which has been dispatched to the respective institutes and others.

The Quality Assurance Team works on all the activities of the University: education, training, research and consultancy. Through BSC an effort is being made to measure quality assurance and its effect on the level of attrition and tutorial services. The Education Policy & Guidelines (page 43-48 section 3.11) presents issues about Quality Assurance. It gives more detailed information about the ways in which the Quality Assurance Policy of the University is implemented and provides a useful reference point for those who need to know about the practical aspects of carrying out the procedures.

Different management reform tools are used to improve the efficiency and quality of the core business of the University. This is also part of the quality assurance arrangements.

The Quality Assurance Team coordinated and participated in the overall activities of the self-evaluation of the University. This was achieved by forming a University level education quality assurance committee. Experts were assigned to provide regular support and continuous follow up. The committee was further divided into three subcommittees, each of which included student membership. The internal quality assurance audit or self evaluation was conducted in the University through a bottom up approach where every audited institute prepared their own self evaluation report by assessing their strengths and weaknesses.

The evaluation of individual courses is being carried out to assess the teaching-learning process at the end of each semester. The University has planned to conduct program evaluations in the near future.

ECSU has undertaken two impact assessment studies in 2001 and 2008 respectively. The impact studies are similar to tracer studies. They revealed the overall picture of the University including, strengths and weaknesses. Data was collected from employers, the community, heads and other

workers. The findings and recommendations are being used to support further short-term and long-term improvement plans.

Having recognized that continuous enhancement of training quality is mandatory to meet the needs of the customer, ECSU training managers and teams have been given the responsibility to address the following important issues in all courses:

- The relevance of training to the priority area of public service (directly applicable to the actual situation)
- Participation of customers in training program development
- Quality enhancing indicators:
 - > Competence of trainers (experienced and credible delivery)
 - > Standard of training materials (high quality materials)
 - > Training facilities
 - > Trainees' participation.

There are a range of good practices identified in the University. They are helpful to the University and other HEIs in the country. The University identified best practices at department, institute and University levels using different procedures, such as repeatedly holding consultative meetings (bi-weekly meetings held at department level in BSC), workshops, symposiums, etc. Best practices are being shared among different departments and institutes within and outside the University by using different channels through newsletters, booklets, websites, and events such as the celebration of Teaching-Learning Day.

With regard to Focus Area 10 (Internal Quality Assurance) the EQA team commends the University on the following:

- (i) The establishment of the Quality Assurance Team.
- (ii) Availability of Quality Assurance office.
- (iii) Inclusion of Quality assurance issues in the the Education Policy Guidelines of the University.
- (iv) The Internal Quality Assurance Audit Handbook developed by the Quality Assurance Team.
- (v) Arrangements for disseminating the Internal Quality Assurance Audit Handbook to the respective institutes and other pertinent bodies of the University.
- (vi) The impact assessment conducted a couple of times.
- (vii) The mechanisms for identifying and sharing the good practices of the University.
- (viii) The existence of adequate inputs to assure quality.

The following are the recommendations of the EQA team on Focus Area 10 (Internal Quality Assurance)

A. Essential recommendations

The EQA team recommends that the University:

- (i) prepares an annual plan for quality assurance activities;
- (ii) ensures that quality assurance activities are cascaded at department level;
- (iii) undertakes a regular comprehensive program evaluation and;
- (iv) takes actions to improve programs following evaluations;

B. Advisable recommendations

The EQA team recommends that the University:

- (v) strengthens the existing commendable activities;
- (vi) monitors the progress of the implementation of the quality assurance policy;

C. Desirable recommendations

The EQA team recommends that the University:

- (vii) ensures that the quality assurance responsibilities are known to the HEI community;
- (viii) strengthens further the practice to systematically identify and disseminate best practices in teaching and learning and other core activities to the University community;
- (ix) conducts regular quality assessments on various aspects of core activities;
- (x) raises continuous awareness and;
- (xi) provides training to staff on quality assurance matters.

Thematic Enquiries and Audit Trails

The EQA audit team did not pursue any specific thematic enquiries or audit trails. **Good**

Practices

The SED (page 47-49) reported the major exemplary activities of the University. Among these, according to the EQA team, some aspects could be considered as best practice and can be shared with other HEIs. The best practices outlined include;

1) Impact Assessment Studies: *ECSU conducted two phased impact assessment studies; the major purpose of the first phase impact assessment was to assess the contributions of the education and training graduates of ECSU to improving the performance of civil service institutions of the regions. The major purpose of the second phase impact assessment was to investigate the performance of the Ethiopian Civil Service University's graduates in various federal and regional government offices, assess the effectiveness of their education and training programs and gather reflections of the public towards the services of the University's graduates.*

Based on these impact assessment studies the University has opened public sector responsive programs and redesigned business processes, policies and guidelines.

2) Teaching- Learning Day Celebration: This is being carried out with the aim of employee recognition for positive impact on an organization.

ECSU firmly believes that employee recognition helps to create a positive, productive, and innovative organizational climate. As an educational institution, the Ethiopian Civil Service University celebrates a teaching and learning day which should be a source of pride and give a sense of achievement to everyone involved. On this remarkable day, the University gave teaching-learning recognition awards for the six best instructors drawn from four institutes and one center. The recipients were selected based on their competence and commitment to the duties and responsibilities they are given.

3) Participatory Redesigned Process and Strategic Planning (BPR and BSC) Formulation and Implementation: *The University has used business process re-engineering (BPR) and Balanced Score Card (BSC) as change management strategies to improve the quality of its core programs and services and the support process, with the objective of increased efficiency and effectiveness. The University has benefited from the participatory approach of most of the academic and administrative staff in the formulation and implementation of BPR and BSC. Moreover the ECSU shares its experience on BPR and BSC formulation and implementation with various Higher Education Institutions and Civil service organizations.*

4) Quality Assurance Evaluation Approach: *The University established a Quality Assurance Team (QAT) of two experts and one team leader under the Institutional Planning Assessment to support the educational institutions of the University and support University management in their work to continuously enhance the quality of their educational programs.*

5) Redesigned Business Process, Policies and Guidelines: *So far the University has passed through many changes and the process of changes has touched and transformed practically everything that goes on within the University. The impact of change has been tremendous on the core business of the University, namely, teaching, training, research and consultancy. The process of change, hall marked by*

BPR, has introduced and put in place a number of innovative ideas that are change sensitive.

The changes and the process of change are also documented and designed in the form of policies and guidelines for further references and to be an implementation check list. e.g., education policy and guidelines, research policy and guidelines, quality assurance handbook etc.

6) Dormitory Service: *At University level, 1 toilet and 1 shower were being used by 10 to 13 students respectively. Proctors are assigned in every block to monitor the sanitation, and the security of the dormitories and to facilitate the maintenance of electric outlets, chairs, lockers and other materials. Student representatives unanimously agreed that ECSU offers the best dormitory services to students.*

7) Responsiveness to Public Sector Priority Programs: *ECSU's education programs are developed in ways that take into account the country's capacity building strategies, thereby ensuring the relevance of the curricula. According to the University president (ECSC, 2010), one aim of the specialized programs at the masters and PhD levels is to produce senior experts who can staff the various civil service capacity building institutes at federal and regional levels as trainers and researchers. Some of the civil services institutes need capacity building institutes at federal and regional levels as trainers and researchers. Some of the civil services institutes also require highly trained experts who can identify problems and come up with solutions through research.*

8) Staff development: *ECSU has taken short and long term staff development as an important priority area since its establishment. ECSU staffs have been making strenuous efforts to develop professionalism and to effect attitudinal change.*

The EQA team had the opportunity to verify all these practices with sound evidence. Documentation, visits, discussions and observation of teaching provided evidence that the University claimed did exist in practice. These exemplary practices can be applied to other HEIs too.

Plans for enhancement of processes and practices

The SED (page 49-51) provides a well-organized and very detailed Quality Enhancement Plan and Action Plan. The improvement plan sets goals in response to the recommendations in the report, as well as for any developmental issues identified by the University itself. The improvement plan prioritizes these goals and proposes explicit actions to be undertaken by the University within a specified time frame to achieve these priorities. The quality enhancement plan includes:

- *A short narrative, which deals with the findings of the internal quality audit report*
- *How the University plans to deal with the recommendations*
- *How and why priorities are established*
- *Where the overall responsibility for the improvement plan lies*
- *Who approves the plans, how progress will be monitored and evaluated*
- *Who will serve as the University contact person for the follow-up process and develop action plan in tabular format.*

Conclusion

The overall conclusion of the EQA team is that the Ethiopian Civil Service University is a modest size government higher education institution. It focuses on specialized programs that are not offered in other higher education institutions, but are essential to fill the gaps in the civil service of the nation and are given utmost priority. Besides having graduated thousands of students from regular degree programs, it has put in place an infrastructure and established practices that could allow for more growth in regular student numbers should the demand arise. The University has found it difficult to recruit adequate numbers of staff with PhDs and hence, is not meeting Ministry of Education requirements. However, a total of 44 academic staff of ECSU is now attending their PhD study. Thus the EQA team is of the opinion that the University needs to maintain its efforts to support staff development.

The University has made significant efforts to monitor the quality and relevance of the education it is providing. As research and community services are the two major tasks among the core activities, the University has developed a research culture among its staff. Research contributes a viable service to the surrounding community.

The vision statement of the University is "*Excellence in Public Sector Capacity Building*". This statement is not time bound or geographically bound. The University will continue to require effort and considerable resources to further its current position in the realization of its vision, however, the foundation for the necessary development is firm.

Appendix 1: Acronyms

ARO	Admission and Registration Office
ASCRC	Academic Standards and Curriculum Review Committee
BPR	Business Process Reengineering
BSC	Balanced Scorecard
CAPD	Center for Academic and Professional Development
CGAD	Center for Gender and Development
DLC	Development Learning Center
EC	Ethiopian Calendar
ECSU	Ethiopian Civil Service University
EQA	External Quality Audit
HAMU	HIV and AIDS Management Unit
HEI	Higher Education Institution
HERQA	Higher Education Relevance and Quality Agency
HRM	Human Resource Management
ICAA	Institute for Certification of Accountants and Auditors
ICDE	Institute of Continuing and Distance Education
IFLS	Institute of Federalism and Legal Studies
ILG	Institute of Legal and Governance
IPA	Institutional Planning and Assessment
IPMDS	Institute of Public Management and Development Studies
ITCA	Institute of Tax and Custom Administration
IUDS	Institute of Urban Development Studies
OPAC	Online Public Access Catalog
PFM	Public Finance Management
QA	Quality Assurance
RPCO	Research Publication Coordination Office
SED	Self Evaluation Document
ULDMD	Urban Land Development Management
UMMP	Urban Management Master's Program
VPAD	Vice President for Academic Development

Appendix 2: The Institutional Quality Audit Team

1. Dr. Woldeemmanuel Walombo (Addis Ababa University)
2. Dr. Mendida Berkessa (Addis Ababa University)
3. Dr. Ferede Befekadu (Unity University)
4. Mr. Dawit Kassa (HERQA)
5. Mr. Mulugeta Mekonnen (HERQA)

Appendix 3: Timetable of the Institutional Quality Audit Visit

Day 1

Meeting with University /HERQA Liaison Officer
Establishment of work base/meeting room

Discussion of timetable Study of documentation
 Meeting with President
 Meeting with senior staff on mission, vision, goals, organizational structure, roles and responsibilities
 Meeting with quality assurance team members on quality assurance and relevance
 Meeting with curriculum committee members on program relevance and curriculum development,
 review and approval
 Visits to facilities (libraries, dormitories, offices, clinic, student canteen and lounge) Audit team meeting

Day 2

Study of documentation
 Observe teaching
 Meeting with senior staff on teaching and learning
 Meeting with senior staff on staffing matters
 Meeting with staff representatives/selected ordinary staff
 Meeting with senior staff on student assessment and examinations
 Meeting with Heads of Student Support Services on student support
 Audit team meeting

Day 3

Study of documentation
 Meeting with student representatives
 Meeting with senior staff and Registrar on student admissions, student progression, student satisfaction and graduate destinations
 Team work on thematic enquiries/Audit trails (best practices of the university explored) Study of documentation
 Visit staff offices, ICT Computer Laboratories, Engineering and architecture laboratories, Registrar, gender office, workshop, and store Meeting with research personnel on research
 Audit team meeting

Day 4

Study of documentation
 Meeting with senior staff on topic suggested by the University
 Meeting with deans and Heads of Department
 Meeting with senior staff and external stakeholders/employers
 Meeting with Quality assurance team members and officers from consultancy service on quality assurance, consultancy and community service Audit team meeting
 Meeting with Director/ Acting President

Appendix 4: Participants in meetings held during the Institutional Quality Audit

Name	Position
Ababu Defare	ITCA, Director
Abay Akemachew	CGAD, Head
Abdusemed Ibrahim	Student
Abi Siyoum	Male's Dormitory, Proctor
Abrham Kinfie	Student Union, V/president
Alazar Ali	DLC, Team Coordinator
Alemayehu Seberu	IPA, Quality Assurance Team Head
Ashenafi Beyene (PhD)	PFM, Department Head (Assistant professor)
Ashenafi Fisseha	IT Specialist
Ayele Bekele	CTC, Team Leader
Ayeneabeba Andualem	CAPD Director
Beker Hadji	Guidance & Counseling Officer
Belete Kebede	PFM, Lecturer
Beyansie Asfaw	ITCA, D/Director
Bizunesh Bishaw	Student Cafe, Head
Christophe Van Der Beren (PhD)	IFLS, Department Head
Daniel Admassu	ITS, Head
Defar Assefa	Senior Nurse
Dejene Mamo	Tax and Custom Administration, Department Head

Demeke Haile	IU DS, Head of ULDM
Demise Mered	HRM, Head
Demis Abate	GCMF
Dereje Terefe (PhD)	CPPS, Director
Deribe Assefa	IPMDS, Lecturer
Desalegn Shekabu	ICDE, Director
Emanuel G/Yohannes (PhD)	Chairman of the senate staff promotion standing committee
Ermias Wondie	Registrar, Head
Essayas Derive	UPMP, Lecturer (Assistant Professor)
Esayas Shiferaw	IU DS, Head
Eshetie Abebe	CAPD, Expert
Fitsum Kebera	CTC, Director
Getachew H/Mariam	Student Council
Getahun Gut	ITCA, Lecturer
Gumate Yimer	Library Check Point, Staff
Hailemichael Abera (PhD)	President of the University
Jalle Olana	Student
Kebede Bishaw	IU DS, Director
Kibru Sileshi	Library Service, D/ Director,
Megersa Tolera	Student Council
Mehreteab G/Selasie	ICDA, Member
Mekonnen Jemaneh (PhD)	V/President for Development & Administration
Mekuanint Demisse	ITCA, Team Leader, Administration & Support Team
Mellese Damtie	IFLS, Lecturer
Meseret Daniel	Student
Mohammed Abdulahi	IFLS, Lecturer (Assistant Professor)
Mulubrhan Seyoum	IU DS, D/Director
Nesru Awel	ARO, Team Leader
Philipos Petros	HAMU, Head and Senior Staff
Rahel Sintayehu	IU DS, Lecturer
Samson Kassahun (PhD)	Academic Vice President
Samuel Gizaw	ITS Infrastructure, Team Leader
Seble Gebreyes	Library, Head
Selamawit Teshome	Reference and Circulation
Selomon Worku	Reference and Circulation
Shawel Asfaw	IPMDS-Development Management, Department Head
Shibeshi Mengistu	Student Council, Member
Shoa Jemal	IPMDS, Head Department of Public Management (Assistant Professor)
Solomon Abay (PhD)	IFLS, Director

Solomon Negusie (PhD)	IFLS, Senior Staff (Associate Professor)
Solomon Yilma	Male Dormitory, Coordinator
Tamirat Wagore	CTC, Team Leader
Tegegn Gebeyaw	IPA, Officer
Tegegnwork Amare	ARO, Team Leader
Tesfaye Solomon	RPCO, Director
Tewodros Gizachew	IPA, Quality Assurance Expert, Liaison Officer
Tihitina Ayalew	ITCA, Head of Public Procurement and Asset Management
Tilahun Fekede	School of Graduate Studies, Director
Tiruye Alemu	PR, Head
Waqqari Negari (PhD)	ILG, Director
Woldemichael Missebo	IFLS, Lecturer
Wondimu Moges	External and Public Relations Department, Staff
Wondiye Kebede	IPA, Quality Assurance Expert
Woineshet Haile	Female Dormitory, Proctor
Workineh Taffese	Circulation Coordinator
Yemer Mohammed	IUDS, Staff
Yenebeb Tizazu	RPCO, Expert
Yeshimebet Asfaw	Head for Documentation of Postgraduate Section
Yitades Taddese	Health Clinic, Laboratory Technician
Yohannes Neda	IPMDS, D/Director
Zeru Getenet	Student Service, Dean
Zeidan Abubeker	Student Council, Member
Zerihun Temesgen	Health Clinic, Druggist
Zeru Getnet	Student Dean
Zewdie Bezabeh	Public Financial Management, Department Head

(Note: this list may be incomplete as not all those present in meetings recorded their names)

Appendix 5: Documents requested from the University

Requested Documentation for Institutional Quality Audit Visit to Ethiopian Civil Service University *(the documents in bold-italic type are requested from all HEIs being audited)*

- ***Senate Legislation.***
- ***Policy documents.***
- ***Current Strategic Plan.***
- ***Current annual plan.***
- ***Most recent annual report to the Ministry of Education.***
- ***Current course catalog.***
- ***Staff handbooks.***
- ***Student handbooks.***

- ***Names of male and female academic staff in each department with their rank and qualifications.***
- ***Workshop reports published in previous 12 months.***
- ***Most recent research report.***
- ***Most recent copies of journals published by the HEI.***
- ***Reports on the HEI published in the previous 12 months.***
- Data on Academic staff profile, qualification by program, gender, rank, fulltime/part time, Expatriate-local (External public relation office; ECSC, April 2010/2011)
- Data on Student Enrollment / undergraduate, graduate/ for the last 5 years, by year, program, gender, regular, extension and distance, by year/ 1st , 2nd , 3rd , 4th /
- Data on Number of graduates/Bachelor degree and Masters degree/for the last 5 years by year, program, gender, regular, extension and distance
- Data on Postgraduate and Undergraduate student staff ratio by program/department/sex
- Documentation on Vision, Mission and Goal statements
- Description of organizational structure
- Job descriptions
- Annual performance reports
- Description of facilities and resources; inventories
- Faculty manuals
- Staff development policy
- Staff workload documents
- Documents on careers guidance
- Documents on student counseling
- Description of the curriculum (program and course) approval procedures
- Minutes of meetings of committees dealing with curriculum approval, monitoring and review at departmental, faculty and senate level
- Curriculum review reports
- Policy documents on teaching and assessment
- Examination committee reports
- Reports of reviews of teaching, learning and assessment
- Registrar's Office reports
- Data on student attrition and completion rates
- Graduate newsletters
- Tracer studies of graduates, lists of employer contacts
- Employer feed-back reports
- Collections of recent publications
- Summary of links

- Quality Assurance policy
- Institutional self evaluations
- Academic calendar
- Written documents about BSC (2003-2007) (page 2)
- Written documents about activities of the Research, Publication Coordination Office (page 2)
- Written documents about activities of the Center for Academic and professional Development (page 2)
- Written documents about activities of the Quality Assurance Team (page 3)
- Quality Assurance Handbook (page 3)
- Sample of Minutes of the meetings of Quality Assurance Committee established under each Institute (page 3)
- Written documents about the impact assessments carried out in the First Phase (ECSC 2001) and Second Phase (ECSC, 2008) (page 4)
- Sample of minutes of meetings of the Quality Audit Committee (page 4)
- Written documents about the Business Process Reengineering management tool and Balanced Scorecard (page 4)
- Written documents about the impact assessment report used as an input for the college BPR (page 4)
- BPR study needs assessment (page 4)
- Written documents about the activities of Education and Training Quality assurance Team established under Institutional Planning and Assessment (page 4)
- ECSC, Balanced Scorecard (2010-2014) (page 5)
- Sample of minutes of the meetings of BSC steering committee (Page 6)
- Written documents about the activities of College level BSC team (page 6)
- Written documents about the activities of External Public Relation Department (page 6)
- Quarterly News Letter, Oct-Dec, 2010, V4: N0 2 (page 6)
- A bi-lingual (English & Amharic) monthly News Letter (page 7)
- Sample of yearly issued post cards (page 7)
- Institute Handbooks (page 7)
- Graduation Bulletin (page 7)
- Written document about the plan to launch a community radio; Addis Zemen, Saturday, Ginbot 6, 2003 EC (Page 8)
- The College reestablishment proclamation No. 12/2006 and Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia Capacity Building Strategy and Program (1994:236) (page 9)
- Sample of Minutes of the Executive Committee (management committee) (page 9)
- Sample of Minutes of the Academic Standards and Curriculum Review Committee (page 9)

- Sample of Minutes of the meetings of Research and Publication Committee (page 9)
- Sample of Minutes of the meetings of Academic Staff Promotion Committee (page 9)
- Sample of Minutes of the meetings of any Ad Hoc Committee (page 9)
- Sample of Minutes of the meetings of Senate (page 9)
- Sample of Minutes of the meetings of the two editorial committees (page 10)
- Sample of Minutes of the meetings of Institutes' Councils (page 10)
- Sample of Minutes of the meetings of Department Council (page 10)
- Sample of Minutes of the meetings of Standing Committees in Institutes' Council (page 10)
- Sample of Minutes of the meetings of Student Council (page 10)
- Sample of Minutes of the meetings of College Level Quality Assurance Committee (page 10)
- Research Policy and Guidelines (page 11)
- Training Policy and Guidelines (page 12)
- Consultancy Policy and Guidelines (page 12)
- List of facilities and learning resources /infrastructure/ training halls, Lecture Theatre rooms, meeting halls; laboratories (page 13)
- Written documents about the activities of Centers of Academic and Professional Development (page 22)
- Written documents about the provisions of student services (page 25)
- The budget forecast for the coming three years (2004-2006) prepared based on the principles of program budgeting
- Sample of pamphlets and leaflets containing programs' objectives, course and major student requirements (page 29)
- Sample of course outlines (page 29)
- Sample of course syllabus (page 30)
- Written document about the training conducted in a three round of two days in Adama town with regard to teaching and learning (page 30)
- Written documents about the staff development workshop series sample schedule (page 30)
- Written document about the two types of tutorials that are being given to students (by ITCA (ITCA:15) (page 32)
- Sample of newly designed instructors BSC performance evaluation format (page 33)
- Sample of Attendance sheets (page 34)
- IPMDS curriculum review report
- Written documents about continuous assessment (page 37)
- Sample of graduate thesis assessment and grading criteria (page 37)
- The report of impact assessment conducted to assess the competency and performance of its graduates in 2001 and 2008 (ECSC, 2008:83) (page 40)
- Sample of Journals "Journal of African Development Studies" Dec 2010 and "Ethiopian Journal of Public Management and Development" July 2010

- A report on Assessment of the practices of Civil Service Reform Program in Ethiopia
- A report on Formalization and in-formalization process in Urban Ethiopia: incorporating informality (page 41)
- A report on Decentralization and Urban Service Delivery in Ethiopia 2011 (page 41)
- A written document about the activities of The College HIV/AIDS Management Unit (page 42)
- List of students and their research titles
- Memorandum of agreement signed with the international HEIs
- Colleges' annual plan (2002EC) and Six months report of 2003 EC
- March 2011 Newsletter Vol7 No 6:3 that shows the donation of educational materials and office furniture to ten government and public schools in Yeka sub city (page 44)
- Information on clinics, toilet
- Brochures, leaflets, newsletters, magazines about the University
- Statistical data on administrative staff broken down by qualification and gender.

Appendix 6: Documents consulted for the Institutional Quality Audit

- ECSU; Documentation on Academic Staff Profile by Rank and program, Full time, Ethiopian Expatriate
- ECSU; Documentation on the number of undergraduate regular student enrollments in the last five years
- ECSU; Documentation on the total number of regular graduates between 1998 (1990EC)-2011(2003 EC)
- ECSU; Documentation on Postgraduate and graduate student to staff ratio by institutes, programs/Department & sex
- ECSU; Documentation on current administrative staff by qualification and gender
- ECS College; Organizational Structure, April 2009
- ECSU, Documentation on Communication letters to Government purchases for resource administration
- ECSU, Documentation on Academic staff work load report, staff work load, semester load 2011/12
- ECSC; Academic Programs office standards for curriculum approval, June 2004
- ECSU; Documentation on sample of minutes of curriculum review committee meeting; curriculum review for masters program; minutes of AC meeting pertaining to review of curriculum; the detail explanation of the curriculum review of MA program of ITCA; MA in Public Finance Management; Minutes of the Department Council meeting; Minutes of the Senate meeting
- ECSU; Documentation on communication letters about sending educational quality enhancement plan
- Ethiopian Civil Service College; Institute of Tax and Customs Administration, curriculum for Masters of Art in Custom Administration
- ECSC; Institute of Tax and Customs Administration; Curriculum for Bachelor Of Arts in Public Procurement and Asset Management

- ECSC; Institute of Tax and Customs Administration' report on Curriculum Review for BA in Public Financial Management' Compiled by The Staff of Public Financial Management Department
- ECSC; IPM and DS, Department of Development Management Revised Curriculum (Degree Program), May 2002
- ECSC ITCA, Revised Curriculum for BA degree Program, public financial management January 2011
- ECSC; Education Policy & Guidelines, May 2009
- ECSU; Admission and Registration Office; University Calendar 2011/12
- ECSU; Admission and Registration Office; College Calendar 2010/11
- ECSU; Institute of Leadership and Good Governance, Student Handbook, Dec 2010
- ECSU; Institute of Public Management and Development Studies; Department of Economics Development ; the Graduate Students' Handbook, Sep 2011
- ECSU; Institute of Public Management and Development Studies; Department of Management Development Degree Program; Students' Handbook, Sep 2011
- ECSU; Institute of Public Management and Development Studies; Department of Public Management; the Graduate Students' Handbook, Sep 2011.
- ECSU, Student Handbook, Admission and Registration Office, Sep 2011
- ECSC Admission Office Institutional Planning and Assessment; Documentation on communication letters with admission and registration office
- ECSU, Proceedings of the Fourth National Conference on the Effectiveness and Efficiency of the Public Sector, May 31,2001
- ECSU, Proceedings of the First National Conference on the Achievements, Challenges and Prospectus of the Civil Service Reform Implementation in Ethiopia, May 31-June 1, 2007
- ECSU, Proceedings of the Second National Conference on the Challenges and Achievements of Public Service July, 4/ 2008
- The Design and Implementation of Business Process Reengineering in the Ethiopian Public Sector: An Assessment of Four Organizations. OSSREA
- ECSU, Journal of African Development Studies Vol 1, No 1 Dec 2008
- ECSU, Journal of African Development Studies Vol 2, No 2 Dec 2009
- ECSU, Journal of African Development Studies Vol 3, No 1 Dec 2010
- ECSU, Journal of African Development Studies Vol 4, No 1 Dec 2011
- ECSU, Ethiopian Journal of Public Management and Development Vol 1:No. 1 July 2010
- ECSU, Ethiopian Journal of Public Management and Development Vol 2:No. 1 July 2011
- ECSU, Documentation on Admission & Registration Office Semester I for the Year 2011/12
- ECSU, External & Public relation & Marketing Department. Monthly Newsletter. Feb 2009 Vol3 No.12
- ECSU, Quarterly Newsletter. Oct-Dec 2010 Vol 4 No 2Feb 2009 Vol3 No.12
- ECSU, Urban Management Master Thesis Series: UNMP-1. Formal and Informal Process in Urban Ethiopia: Incorporating Informality. Fransen & Kassahun

